

**MINUTES
FACULTY SENATE
THE UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA®
May 4, 1998**

**These minutes may be accessed electronically at:
<http://w3.arizona.edu/~senate/minutes.htm>**

1. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Presiding Officer Jeffrey L. Warburton at 3:00 p.m. in Room 146 of the College of Law. Senator Warburton welcomed all new and returning Senators to the first session of the 1998-99 Faculty Senate. He noted that the three graduate student representatives to the 1998-99 Senate would be chosen later.

Present: Senators Aleamoni, Atwater, Caldwell, Christiano, Clarke, Dahlgran, D. Davis, T. Davis, Dvorak, Dyl, Erlings, Ervin, Garcia, Gruener, Heckler, Heinrich, Hernandez, Hogle, Howell, Hurt, Impey, Jenkins, Larson, Levin, Levy, Likins, Marchalonis, Maré, Medine, Merkle, Miller, Mishra, Mitchell, Nolan, O'Brien, Pepper, Silverman, Swindle, Szilagyi, Taylor, Troy, Voyatzis, Warburton, Weinand, Witte, and Zwolinski. Robert Sankey served as Parliamentarian.

Absent: Senators Armstrong, Erickson, Joens, Johnson, Laetsch, Pitt, Schooley, Spece, Suma, and Sypherd.

2. OPEN SESSION

(Please note that speakers at the Open Session are expressing their personal opinion, which may not reflect the position of the Faculty Senate.)

Ms. Janolyn Lo Vecchio reported that Senate Bill 1168, which addresses inequity in retirement benefits for disabled state employees, is in danger of being "killed" because it has not yet been scheduled to be heard by the Rules Committee, and the current session of the Arizona Legislature is rapidly drawing to a close. Ms. Lo Vecchio, a disabled UA classified staff employee, referred to the informational sheet placed on desks and urged Senators to contact members of the Rules Committee to request a hearing of the bill, which she described as "totally unopposed" up to this point. She also said she would work with State Senator Victor Soltero, sponsor of the bill, to re-introduce it again next year if necessary, and she asked for Faculty Senators' continued support in that event.

Senator Medine reported that approximately \$6 million would be required to bring UA faculty salaries up to averages published by the American Association of Universities Data Exchange (AAUDE). That is, in order to bring every individual faculty member up to, or within reach of, the average for his or her rank in the discipline would require about \$6 million. The legislature is expected to appropriate approximately \$3.8 million for faculty salaries in 1998-99, Senator Medine noted. If this funding is properly applied, he said, it could take the UA more than half way to a solution to the problem of chronically underpaid faculty. If discrepancies in faculty salaries are not addressed, Senator Medine said, the gap will widen between those who have not received merit awards despite exemplary performance and those who are appropriately compensated. Appealing to principles of sound management, Senator Medine urged that the faculty salary appropriation be used to ameliorate this situation.

3. REPORTS

3A. ASUA President Tara Taylor

Noting that it had been an interesting term, outgoing ASUA President Gilbert Davidson introduced his successor, Ms. Tara Taylor. Ms. Taylor thanked everyone for welcoming her. She commented that her top priorities would be to keep faculty abreast of student issues and to maintain the open lines of faculty-student communication that Senator Davidson developed during the past year.

3B. Presiding Officer of the Faculty Senate Jeffrey Warburton

Presiding Officer Warburton deferred his report until later in the meeting.

3C. Secretary of the Faculty Susan Heckler

Secretary Heckler offered two points of information: (1) The new Faculty Center Webpage will continue in the design phase over the summer and should be ready for viewing late in the summer. (2) A notice regarding distribution of Faculty Senate minutes will be circulated to all General Faculty members early this fall, with all faculty having the opportunity to indicate their preferred format for receiving the minutes.

3D. Chair of the Faculty Jerrold Hogle (Attachment)

Chair Hogle welcomed new and returning Senators, and he thanked outgoing ASUA President Davidson. Referring to the informational sheet distributed on Senators' desks, he reviewed General Faculty achievements during 1997-98: (1) Continuation of the best traditions of Senate governance, under the able leadership of Presiding Officer Warburton. (2) Increasingly effective state relations, thanks in part to the Arizona Faculties Council (AFC), which, among other things, developed the faculty workload study requested by the Arizona Board of Regents (ABOR). Vice Provost for Academic Personnel Libbie Ervin helped greatly with that project, Dr. Hogle noted. After reviewing the workload study, Regents were persuaded that faculty work very hard on teaching and teaching-related activities, and the Legislature discontinued the Teaching Incentive Plan (TIP). For 1998-99 there will be a three-part salary package for faculty, including funding for classification salary adjustment (CSA), merit from the 2.5% state merit pool, and the University Performance Bonus Plan (UPBP). Proposed by State Senator John Huppenthal, UPBP will be funded by collecting at least \$1 million total from all state campuses; this money will be distributed as one-time bonuses for high-performance areas. This fall the state campuses will have to address implementation of UPBP, but it appears to be a small price to pay in exchange for the death of TIP, Chair Hogle said. AFC members also participated, along with students, parents, and administrators from all state campuses, in the Legislative Study Committee on Faculty Roles and Rewards to propose a faculty salary package; one of the most effective members of that group in defending the interests of faculty was UA Provost Paul Sypherd, Dr. Hogle said. A further enhancement of state relations is President Likins' recent appointment of former Chair of the Faculty John Schwarz as Senior Faculty Associate to the President; this will provide more direct involvement of faculty in state-level contacts, Dr. Hogle said. (3) Major advances in shared governance, including the adoption of the shared governance agreement and the plan for extending shared governance, the establishment of the recently expanded Shared Governance Review Committee, and the ongoing work of the Committee on UHAP, Constitution, and Bylaws Changes to conform those documents with each other and with the principles of shared governance. Other examples of increased shared governance on campus are the work of several new committees, such as the Committee on Intellectual Property and Scholarly Communication, the University Committee on Corporate Relationships, and the Chair's Task Force on Faculty Salaries, as well as the ongoing efforts of numerous standing committees. Annual reports from many of those committees are contained in the packets mailed to Senators for today's meeting. (4) The building of greater community at the UA. This is evidenced by greater faculty connection to the Arizona Alumni Association, increased input into University affairs by students and staff, the soon-to-be-formed Task Force on Appointed Personnel, the welcoming of the Arizona International College to the main campus, and the upcoming North Central Accreditation (NCA) Review, which will use as its starting point *The University of Arizona: 2000 and Beyond*, a report from the Strategic Planning and Budget Advisory Committee (SPBAC) that is also enclosed in Senators' packets. Chair Hogle asked Senators to review the SPBAC report carefully and to provide input to SPBAC Chair Joaquin Ruiz. Dr. Hogle concluded his remarks by noting that the greatest challenge the UA now faces is using and/or revising the systems now in place to ensure that every UA contributor feels properly valued, especially when overworked and underpaid.

Chair Hogle and Presiding Officer Warburton then presented plaques of appreciation to outgoing Secretary of the Faculty Rose Gerber and Faculty Center staff members Pam Bridgmon and Donna Leavell. Dr. Hogle also recognized and welcomed incoming Secretary Susan Heckler.

3E. Provost Paul Sypherd

No report, as Provost Sypherd was unable to attend the meeting.

3F. President Peter Likins

President Likins commented that, in his first seven months in the UA Presidency, he has been mainly concerned with building relationships on campus and in the wider community, because developing mutual trust and effective collaborations are essential to accomplishing anything in the position of President. He said he felt very good about the foundations that have been laid thus far. Other highlights: (1) President Likins has changed the organizational structure so that he now has a cadre of six people reporting directly to him, rather than the 16 who previously reported directly to the UA President. He said he expected that the new arrangement would enable him to maintain adequate contact with all segments of the University community without spending so much time on managerial duties. (2) The appointment of John Schwarz as Senior Faculty Associate to the President will continue the work begun last year on improving University relations with the Regents and the Arizona Legislature. Dr. Likins noted that sometimes the best course for a university president is to "get out of the way" and let faculty engage in personal interactions with Regents and legislators. (3) Sensing a need for greater connectedness among faculty, President Likins has begun having small dinner parties to bring together faculty members from all parts of the campus. These dinners not only educate the President about University activities; they also provide an opportunity for faculty from different disciplines to meet and develop a stronger sense of the University as a whole. (4) As the SPBAC report aptly points out, the UA has enormous strengths and incredibly talented, energetic, and devoted personnel; however, if we are to realize our potential, we need to develop a stronger sense of ourselves as a University community. President Likins said he sees the impending construction on the mall (Integrated Learning Center, Student Union renovation, Library extension, and McKale Center extension) as one aspect of building that sense of community. When completed, the enhanced mall area will provide a central gathering place for students, faculty, and staff. In the same vein, Dr. Likins noted that campus life will be a central theme of his Presidency, and Vice President for Campus Life Sandra Taylor will report directly to him. (5) The CatCard and Nike situations have helped to make us think deeply about fundamental issues such as information security on campus and corporate relationships with the institution. President Likins said as long as we deal with all

future issues as openly, directly, honestly, and thoughtfully together as we did with the CatCard and Nike discussions, we should be able to sustain a healthy, long-term relationship.

4. **QUESTION AND ANSWER PERIOD**

Senator Szilagyi asked Chair Hogle if he sees the need for improvement in any aspect of University life, since his report seemed to indicate complete satisfaction. Chair Hogle responded that there is still work to be done on a number of issues, including salaries and issues identified in the focus groups conducted by the Committee of Eleven. (A written report regarding those focus groups was placed on Senators' desks today.) Dr. Hogle added that, with the advent of the shared governance agreement, there are now better processes in place to deal with some of these issues.

Senator Medine asked Chair Hogle if AFC Chair Larry Gould had stated publicly that the UA Faculty Senate had voted on the proposed whistleblower amendment now before the State Legislature. Dr. Hogle said he had spoken to Dr. Gould regarding this, and Dr. Gould denied having made such a statement. Chair Hogle added that Dr. Gould is well aware that this body discussed the issue without taking formal action.

Senator Medine asked President Likins whether the new position of Senior Faculty Associate to the President is an administrative post or a faculty post. President Likins responded that it is an administrative post. He added that he created the position because he perceives the need to be more effective with the Legislature, and it appears that Dr. Schwarz, and probably other faculty, can deal more effectively with Regents and legislators than the University has in the past. He clarified that Dr. Schwarz will represent the President as a faculty member, rather than as a lobbyist. Senator Silverman commented that this appointment is a good idea; he added that the Faculty Senate should also find ways to be more effective with the Legislature, without necessarily forming more committees. Perhaps next year Dr. Schwarz can help the Senate ascertain how faculty can become more involved and proactive, he said. President Likins said that this idea is consistent with what he is trying to accomplish.

Senator Witte asked Chair Hogle if state employees will receive an across-the-board cost-of-living adjustment. Chair Hogle said he had checked on that yesterday, and at this point, it appears unlikely that the appropriations bill will contain a general adjustment for any state employee. President Likins pointed out that a 1% general adjustment, which the Governor's office is advocating, would cost approximately \$15-16 million if it is given to all state employees. Senator Witte commented that she always advocates for a cost-of-living or general adjustment, because of the difficulties of "diagnosing" merit and compression.

5. **APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF APRIL 6, 1998**

The minutes of the Senate meeting on April 6, 1998, were approved as distributed.

6. **ELECTIONS FOR COMMITTEE ON CONCILIATION, UNIVERSITY COMMITTEE ON ETHICS AND COMMITMENT, UNIVERSITY HEARING BOARD, 1998-99 PRESIDING OFFICER OF THE FACULTY SENATE, 1998-99 FACULTY SENATE REPRESENTATIVE ON THE FACULTY SENATE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE, AND MEMBER OF THE SHARED GOVERNANCE REVIEW COMMITTEE**

Votes were cast using written ballots. Senator Zwolinski and Parliamentarian Sankey served as tellers. Presiding Officer Warburton subsequently announced the results of the balloting. Those elected were:

Committee on Conciliation

Mary McCaslin
Keith McElroy
Susan Wilson-Sanders

University Hearing Board

Carol Larson
Gale Manke
Steven Smith
Dianne Winslow

University Committee on Ethics and Commitment

Carol Barnes
John Bradley

Presiding Officer of the Faculty Senate

Jeffrey Warburton

Member of the Shared Governance Review Committee

Billie Raye Erlings

Faculty Senate Executive Committee Representative

Peter Medine

7. **INFORMATIONAL ITEM ON ANNUAL REPORTS FROM STANDING COMMITTEES (Attachments)**

Thanking committee chairs and members for their service this past year, Presiding Officer Warburton called attention to the numerous annual committee reports in Senators' packets and on their desks; he invited questions and comments on individual reports. Several committee chairs provided brief oral reports:

Research Policy Committee (RPC) - Committee Chair Gruener clarified a point from the discussion of the proposed Conflict of Interest and Commitment Policy (CICP) at the last Senate meeting: The CICP does not apply to any activities that are totally unrelated to the normal duties of UA faculty and staff. For example, if a faculty member owns pizza parlors at which he works nights and weekends, the CICP would not come into play unless the work at the pizza parlor interferes with the faculty member's UA job performance to the extent that there is a conflict of commitment. Senator T. Davis commented that it is important to

implement the CICIP as soon as possible; as chair of the University Committee on Ethics and Commitment (UCEC), he has been dealing with commitment issues without having a permanent policy as a guide. He added that he has met with Senator Gruener regarding the CICIP, and he fully endorses the CICIP as drafted. Senator Warburton said the Senate would discuss and vote on the CICIP in the early fall, and he asked Senators to review the proposed policy carefully prior to that time. (The latest revision of the CICIP draft was placed on Senators' desks today.)

Senate Task Force on Arizona International Campus (AIC) - Task Force Chair Roy Emrick provided an update on the search for the AIC Dean: Later this week, four candidates will be interviewed by the search committee, then by AIC students, faculty, and staff. The four finalists are: Edwin Clausen, Professor and Director of the Academic House at AIC; Paul Rosenblatt, Professor of English and Executive Director of International Affairs on the main campus; Lucian Spataro, Associate to the AIC Provost; and Anthony Vuturo, Professor Emeritus of Medicine at the UA.

Committee on Academic Freedom and Tenure (CAFT) - Using overhead transparencies, CAFT Chair Thomas Cetas reviewed statistics and other information from the annual CAFT report: six panels formed (two for one case) and nine informal cases handled during 1997-98. Dr. Cetas stressed the need for confidentiality in CAFT cases, as well as the importance of focusing on the merits of a case. He suggested that former CAFT members would be good candidates for the Committee on Conciliation (COC), since they understand what is involved in a hearing and perhaps could more effectively conciliate cases before they reach the hearing stage. He also noted that there are inconsistencies among the policies and procedures outlined in the *University Handbook for Appointed Personnel* (UHAP), the *Arizona Board of Regents Policy Manual*, and the *Constitution and Bylaws of the General Faculty of The University of Arizona*. Thus, for example, it is not clear in promotion and tenure cases whether complaints should go directly to CAFT or to COC first. This year a small group consisting of the Chair of the Faculty, the CAFT chair, the COC chair, and the Associate Vice President for Affirmative Action met to formulate a procedure for routing various types of complaints; the group agreed that, in P&T cases where a failure of due process is alleged, the complaints would go directly to CAFT. Dr. Cetas also discussed the role of the University Attorneys' Office in CAFT cases, recommending that in internal disputes UA attorneys not provide counsel to department heads and deans, but serve as advisors to senior faculty committees instead. Regarding the rotating chairship of CAFT, Dr. Cetas noted advantages and disadvantages: Changing CAFT chairs every year helps to prevent CAFT from becoming bureaucratized or institutionalized, but it also means that there is little committee memory and the CAFT chair has a very long learning curve every year.

Strategic Planning and Budget Advisory Committee (SPBAC) - Senator Clarke asked SPBAC Chair Joaquin Ruiz why the section of the SPBAC report entitled "Maintaining and Enhancing Excellence in Undergraduate Education" (page 3) contains no mention of class size, which he characterized as "the most critical variable in all education." Dr. Ruiz referred the question to Dr. John Schwarz, since that section summarizes a report prepared by a subcommittee chaired by Dr. Schwarz. Dr. Schwarz responded that the report emphasizes the usefulness of active learning techniques, which can sometimes be used successfully in large-class situations, as well as in small-class environments. Citing the annual report of the Intercollegiate Writing Committee, Senator Clarke pointed out that it is difficult if not impossible to teach writing in large classes, since that involves repeatedly reading and evaluating student papers. Dr. Schwarz thanked Senator Clarke for bringing the matter to the attention of SPBAC.

8. **APPROVAL OF CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS FORWARDED FROM INSTRUCTION AND CURRICULUM POLICY COMMITTEE (Attachment)**

All consent agenda items, presented as seconded motions from the Instruction and Curriculum Policy Committee, were approved unanimously. Motions are detailed at the end of these minutes. [Motion 1997/98-42 through Motion 1997/98-45]

9. **CLARIFICATION OF PERFORMANCE IMPROVEMENT PLAN (Attachment)**

Senator Atwater, Co-Chair of the Academic Personnel Policy Committee (APPC), reviewed the informational item contained in Senators' packets and provided background for this issue: Last spring, following the approval by the three Arizona universities of their respective Annual Performance Review/Post-Tenure Review policies, the ABOR central staff and the AFC prepared a "Common Elements Document." During Summer 1997 the ABOR staff reviewed the procedures developed by each campus for implementing Board policy on post-tenure review, as called for in the Common Elements Document. In September 1997, Dr. Thomas Wickenden, Associate Executive Director for Academic and Student Affairs at the ABOR central office, wrote to Provost Sypherd detailing five common elements that the UA procedures seemed to be lacking or partially lacking. Three of those items have already been addressed and resolved. Dr. Atwater explained that the APPC has prepared responses to the remaining two items (those labeled #3 and #4 in Dr. Wickenden's letter). She reviewed those items and the changes necessary, then called for questions and comments.

Senator T. Davis asked if the PIP policy and procedures provide funding to facilitate a faculty member's improvement plan. Senator Ervin said UHAP contains language that the University will provide resources for people who need them (e.g., help from the University Teaching Center, funding to attend workshops). It is expected that departments and colleges will also provide resources for those who need them, she said.

10. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION ON RESOLUTION TO INDICATE MAJORS ON STUDENT DIPLOMAS (Attachment)**

Senator D. Davis, Chair of the Student Affairs Policy Committee (SAPC), referred to the informational sheet in Senators' packets containing the resolution being forwarded from the SAPC as a seconded motion [Motion 1997/98-46]: "The Faculty Senate

endorses the ASUA Senate's request that a graduating student's major(s) be shown on the graduation diploma and recommends that the Registrar consider adding this information to diplomas as soon as the implementation details can be worked out." Using overhead transparencies, he explained that currently a student's diploma shows only "Bachelor of Science" or "Bachelor of Arts" with no major indicated, but students have expressed an interest in having the major listed. He said he had discussed this possibility with Registrar's Office personnel and they had stated that the addition would not involve extra cost or pose implementation problems. He added that the proposed format was to list the degree on one line and the major on the next line down, without prepositions (e.g., "Bachelor of Science" on one line and "Physics" directly below it).

Dean Levy asked if ABOR policy allows this. He said the College of Science had had problems with the wording on diplomas in the past, and they had been told in certain instances that they would need to create new degree programs in order to word diplomas as they had requested. Parliamentarian Sankey clarified that that was a different issue that had nothing to do with the diploma, but rather with what the UA is authorized to teach. He added that the Faculty Senate some years ago had adopted a policy that diplomas for students in Arts and Sciences (then called Liberal Arts) should state only "Bachelor of Science" or "Bachelor of Arts," with no major indicated. Diplomas for all other students state "Bachelor of Science in (major)" or "Bachelor of Arts in (major)." As a result, the UA now has approximately 25 undergraduate degrees, making it a complex situation.

Senator D. Davis explained that the SAPC had deliberately worded the resolution rather loosely, so that the Registrar's Office would have some latitude in how and when the listing of majors on diplomas is implemented.

Motion 1997/98-46, the resolution recommending that student majors be shown on diplomas as detailed above, was carried, with one vote opposed and one abstention.

11. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:50 p.m.

Susan E. Heckler, Secretary

Appendix*

1. Update on Senate Bills 1168 and 1368 from Jan Lo Vecchio (dated May 3, 1998)
2. General Faculty Achievements, 1997-98
3. Annual reports from committees for 1997-98: Academic Personnel Policy Committee; Instruction and Curriculum Policy Committee; Research Policy Committee; Student Affairs Policy Committee; Committee on UHAP, Constitution, and Bylaws Changes; General Education Oversight Committee; AIC Task Force; Committee on Conciliation; University Committee on Ethics and Commitment; Faculty Chair's Task Force on Faculty Salaries; Committee on Intellectual Property and Scholarly Communication; Intercollegiate Writing Committee; Strategic Planning and Budget Advisory Committee (*The University of Arizona: 2000 and Beyond*); University-Wide General Education Committee; Committee on Academic Freedom and Tenure; Committee of Eleven (original and revised reports)
4. Conflict of Interest and Commitment Policy draft showing revisions from April 3 to April 27, 1998
5. Instruction and Curriculum Policy Committee proposals for possible Faculty Senate action on May 4, 1998 (consent agenda)
6. Memo from Academic Personnel Policy Committee dated April 21, 1998, and materials related to clarification of the Performance Improvement Plan
7. Resolution from Student Affairs Policy Committee regarding listing majors on student diplomas (dated May 4, 1998)
8. Mission statement and committee roster for University Committee on Corporate Relationships
9. Memo from Lawrence Aleamoni, Chair of the Committee of Eleven, dated May 4, 1998, and other materials detailing information collected during spring semester 1998 (electronic focus groups)
10. Preparation for Mall Redevelopment Projects to Begin This Summer

*Copies of material listed in the Appendix are attached to the original minutes and are on file in the Faculty Center.

Motions of the Meeting of May 4, 1998

- | | |
|------------|--|
| 1997/98-42 | Seconded motion from the Instruction and Curriculum Policy Committee to approve a new program: MS in Mexican American Studies offered by the Mexican American Studies and Research Center; motion carried. |
| 1997/98-43 | Seconded motion from the Instruction and Curriculum Policy Committee to approve a new program: Master of Engineering Degree with collaboration among UA, ASU, and NAU; motion carried. |
| 1997/98-44 | Seconded motion from the Instruction and Curriculum Policy Committee to adopt the following policy, to take effect in the Fall 1998 semester: "A student enrolled in an honors course may have the Grade Replacement |

Opportunity only with the same honors course. Petition for a variation in this policy is not available.” Motion carried.

1997/98-45

Seconded motion from the Instruction and Curriculum Policy Committee to adopt exceptions to minor requirements as listed below, effective Fall 1998; motion carried.

Physics minor - Complete one of the following sequences: 151-152-251-252, 141-142-241-242, 141H-142H-241H-242H, 131-181-132-182-242 plus 6 units of upper-division physics courses.

Teaching minor in physics - Complete one of the following sequences: 151-152-251-252, 141-142-241-242, 141H-142H-241H-242H, 131-181-132-182-242 plus 433 and 3 units of upper-division physics courses.

Chemistry minor - Complete 16 units of lower-division course work in general and organic chemistry. Requiring 9 upper-division units raises the chemistry minor to at least 25 units.

Mathematics minor - Complete 15 units of mathematics, chosen from the following courses: 125b, 215, 223, 243, 254, and any upper-division course except 301. Requiring 15 units is justified by the fact that the courses in the minor begin with 125b, second semester calculus. Calculus I can be obtained in a 3-unit or a 5-unit course.

1997/98-46

Seconded motion from the Student Affairs Policy Committee to adopt the resolution listed below; motion carried.

“The Faculty Senate endorses the ASUA Senate’s request that a graduating student’s major(s) be shown on the graduation diploma and recommends that the Registrar consider adding this information to diplomas as soon as the implementation details can be worked out.”