THE MEANING OF THE MUSIC EDUCATION EXPERIENCE TO MIDDLE SCHOOL GENERAL MUSIC STUDENTS

by

Virginia Elaine Wayman

Copyright©Virginia Elaine Wayman 2005

A Dissertation Submitted to the Faculty of the

SCHOOL OF MUSIC AND DANCE

In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements
For the Degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
WITH A MAJOR IN MUSIC

In the Graduate College

THE UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA

2005
THE UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA
GRADUATE COLLEGE

As members of the Dissertation Committee, we certify that we have read the dissertation prepared by Virginia Wayman entitled “The Meaning of the Music Education Experience to Middle School General Music Students” and recommend that it be accepted as fulfilling the dissertation requirement for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy.

Donald Hamann _______________________________ Date: 6/20/2005

Brian Ebie _______________________________ Date: 6/20/2005

Shelly Cooper _______________________________ Date: 6/20/2005

Mary M. McCaslin _______________________________ Date: 6/20/2005

Thomas L. Good _______________________________ Date: 6/20/2005

Final approval and acceptance of this dissertation is contingent upon the candidate’s submission of the final copies of the dissertation to the Graduate College.

I hereby certify that I have read this dissertation prepared under my direction and recommend that it be accepted as fulfilling the dissertation requirement.

Donald Hamann _______________________________ Date: 6/20/2005
STATEMENT BY AUTHOR

This dissertation has been submitted in partial fulfillment of requirements for an advanced degree at the University of Arizona and is deposited in the University Library to be made available to borrowers under rules of the Library.

Brief quotations from this dissertation are allowable without special permission, provided that accurate acknowledgment of source is made. Requests for permission for extended quotation from or reproduction of this manuscript in whole or in part may be granted by the copyright holder.

SIGNED: Virginia Wayman
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to extend my deepest appreciation to the many people who supported me in this project. First I wish to give my most sincere thanks to my dissertation advisor, Dr. Donald Hamann for his encouragement, sage advice, and mentoring during this project and throughout my graduate career. His wisdom and support has been tremendously helpful.

I also wish to thank my doctoral committee, Dr. Brian Ebie, Dr. Shelly Cooper, Dr. Mary McCaslin, and Dr. Thomas Good for their friendship, input, and encouragement. In addition, I wish to thank Dr. Keith Meredith for his instruction in statistics and in the interpretation of the factor analysis. Sincere appreciation is also extended to Dr. Carl Hancock for his assistance with the web-based surveys and electronic data collection.

I extend my enormous gratitude to all of the teachers who assisted in this project, as well as all of the students who took the time to participate in the three phases of this study. This research would certainly not have been accomplished without their kind help. The cooperation of the students, teachers, parents, and school administration made this research possible.

Lastly, I wish to thank my parents, Sue Wayman and Roger Wayman for their love and encouragement, and all of my family and friends for their support.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES ........................................................................................................... 10
LIST OF FIGURES ........................................................................................................ 11
ABSTRACT .................................................................................................................... 12

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION ......................................................................................... 14
  Theoretical Basis of Study ...................................................................................... 14
  The Taxonomy of Educational Objectives ............................................................ 15
  What is “meaning”? ............................................................................................... 17
  Meaning in Education ............................................................................................ 18
  Meaning in the Arts ............................................................................................... 20
  Meaning in Music .................................................................................................... 21
  Meaning in Music Education .................................................................................. 23

Need ............................................................................................................................ 29
  How are Affective outcomes assessed? ................................................................. 30
  Importance of involving students in assessment process ................................... 31

Purpose ...................................................................................................................... 32
  Operational Definitions ....................................................................................... 33
  Overview of Remaining Chapters ........................................................................ 33

CHAPTER 2: REVIEW OF LITERATURE ....................................................................... 35
  Student Perspectives on School ........................................................................... 35
  Student Perspectives on Arts Education ............................................................... 40
TABLE OF CONTENTS--CONTINUED

Student Perspectives on Music Education ....................................................... 41
Student Perspectives on General Music Classes .............................................. 45
Student Perspectives on Middle School/Junior High General Music Classes .... 47
Summary .............................................................................................................. 49
Implications ......................................................................................................... 50

CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY ............................................................................. 51

Sample ............................................................................................................... 51
Development of the Music Meaning Survey .................................................... 52
Description of the Pilot Study .......................................................................... 56
  Description of the Factor Analysis process and Varimax rotation ............ 57
  Creation of the final Music Meaning Survey .............................................. 64
The Main Study: Procedures ......................................................................... 64
  The Sample .................................................................................................... 64
  Administration of the MMS ........................................................................... 65
Analysis ............................................................................................................ 65
Internal Validity ................................................................................................. 66
Summary ............................................................................................................ 67

CHAPTER 4: RESULTS.......................................................................................... 68

Description of the Factor Analysis process of the Music Meaning Survey .... 68
TABLE OF CONTENTS--CONTINUED

Description of each factor ................................................................. 74
  Vocational .................................................................................. 74
  Academic .................................................................................... 75
  Belongingness ............................................................................ 76
  Agency ....................................................................................... 77
  Reliability of the four factors ..................................................... 77
  Intercorrelations among the factors ............................................. 79
  Summary .................................................................................... 81

CHAPTER 5: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS .................... 82
  Summary ..................................................................................... 82
  Discussion .................................................................................. 85
    Vocational ............................................................................... 85
    Academic ................................................................................ 86
    Belongingness ....................................................................... 88
    Agency ................................................................................... 89
  Aesthetic or Utilitarian? ............................................................... 90
  Conclusions .............................................................................. 92
  Implications for Future Research .............................................. 93
  Implications for Music Education ............................................ 96
TABLE OF CONTENTS–CONTINUED

APPENDICES ........................................................................................................................................ 99

A: TEACHER INSTRUCTION PAGE FOR INSTRUMENT CREATION
    SURVEY ........................................................................................................................................ 99

B: INSTRUMENT CREATION PHASE SURVEY ................................................................. 102

C: COMPLETE ORIGINAL STATEMENTS OF MEANING FROM
    SUBJECTS IN INSTRUMENT CREATION PHASE ...................................................... 105

D: EXAMPLE STATEMENTS FROM INSTRUMENT CREATION PHASE,
    WITH RESEARCHER MODIFICATIONS ................................................................. 129

E: SUBJECTS’ STATEMENTS FROM INSTRUMENT CREATION PHASE,
    ORGANIZED QUALITATIVELY BY CATEGORY ................................................. 132

F: SELECTED STATEMENTS BY CATEGORY, USED IN THE
    INSTRUMENT CREATION PHASE SURVEY .................................................. 148

G: PILOT MUSIC MEANING SURVEY ........................................................................... 154

H: ROTATED FACTOR MATRIX, PILOT STUDY .................................................... 161

I: STATEMENTS IN THE 5 FACTOR CATEGORIES, AFTER PILOT ...... 165

J: FINAL MMS, PAPER SURVEY ....................................................................................... 168

K: INSTRUCTIONS FOR GIVING THE ONLINE MMS ........................................ 172

L: TEACHER ASSENT FORM, PARENT/STUDENT CONSENT FORM, AND
    SITE AUTHORIZATION FORM .............................................................................. 175

M. HUMAN SUBJECTS AUTHORIZATION LETTER ............................................. 180
TABLE OF CONTENTS—CONTINUED

REFERENCES............................................................................................................................................. 182
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Rotated Factor Matrix ................................................................. 69
Table 2: Percent of Variance in rotated factor structure ............................... 73
Table 3: Factor 1, Vocational: statements and signature loadings .................. 74
Table 4: Factor 2, Academic: statements and signature loadings .................... 75
Table 5: Factor 3, Social: statements and signature loadings .......................... 76
Table 6: Factor 4, Psychological: statements and signature loadings ................. 77
Table 7: Reliability Coefficients for each factor category: whole sample .......... 78
Table 8: Reliability Coefficients for each factor category ............................... 79
Table 9: Intercorrelations between the factors ............................................ 80
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Scree Plot............................................................................................................72
ABSTRACT

The purpose of this study was to investigate the meaning of music education to middle school students in general music classrooms.

Specifically, this study addresses the following questions:

1. What meaning do middle school general music students derive from their musical education?
2. Do underlying dimensions exist in this meaning? If these dimensions do exist, what are they and what relationships exist among them?

To answer these questions, a two-part study was proposed. In part one, a survey instrument was created by gathering middle school students’ responses to an open-ended question. The 178 participants generated 670 responses. These responses were analyzed and then reduced to 147 relatively distinct statements of meaning. Responses were analyzed qualitatively by grouping the items with others that appeared similar.

In the second part of the study, student responses were used to construct a survey, called the Music Meaning Survey (MMS). The survey was first piloted in Tucson, Arizona with a sample of students (N = 96), in order to test the clarity and usability of the MMS. The results of the pilot survey were factor analyzed using principal components analysis and a varimax rotation. The factor analysis confirmed the existence of five factor categories: Psychological, Future Music Goals, Academic-Musical, Performing/Music Making and Integrative (social).
A total of 50 statements of meaning were used for the final version of the Music Meaning Survey. The MMS was then administered during the spring of 2005. According to the MMS, subjects did ascribe particular meaning to music education. In particular, it was found that the meaning students derived from their music education experience could be assimilated into four categories: Vocational (career-oriented outcomes for learning about music), Academic (academic aspects of music class such as reading music, learning about composers, and musical styles), Belongingness (social interactions between individual students and groups of students), and Agency (related to students’ self-esteem, motivation, and emotional development). The primary conclusion that can be drawn from this study is that for middle school students, music class can be a meaningful and multi-faceted experience.
CHAPTER 1
INTRODUCTION

When one discusses the meaning of music in education, two dominant themes appear: one of musical meaning as a definitional, philosophical construct and one of music as a practical and functional subject, valued for what it can do in a given setting. In today’s educational climate, a heavy emphasis is given to assessment of cognitive outcomes. Assessment in music education, too, is heavily focused on cognitive areas in order to ensure that music programs are seen as valuable to education (Klotman, 1973). Musical skills and knowledge are emphasized in most assessment rubrics: for example, music theory, history, and performance abilities. Less attention is given to determining what other outcomes may result from a musical education, and on the assessment of these outcomes. In addition, little empirical research exists upon which the focus is student perceptions of meaning in music education, though philosophers and educators have developed valuable theories concerning the meaning of musical experiences. Because meaning is individually created and differs from student to student, teachers have few means of assessing the meaningfulness of music education as perceived by students.

Theoretical Basis of the Study

The theoretical basis for this study will be divided into three parts. First Bloom’s Taxonomy, particularly the Affective Domain, will be discussed. Next, the term “meaning” will be explored: the meaning of acts and behavior, activities, objects, and experiences, as well as the meaning of educational experiences. Finally, musical meaning
and meaning in music education will be discussed, reviewing the sometimes conflicting theories of the purpose of music education.

The Taxonomy of Educational Objectives

Beginning in 1948, a group of psychologists led by Benjamin Bloom (1956) assembled to classify important educational objectives. Their work led to the creation of three domains, or categories, in which most educational outcomes could be placed. The first domain, Cognitive, encompasses those outcomes which involve performing intellectual tasks such as remembering, as well as complex processes such as analysis and synthesis. The Affective domain involves the emotions, feelings, and values, including interests, attitudes, and appreciation. The third domain, Psychomotor, emphasizes motor skills and muscular abilities, such as the manipulation of objects or acts requiring coordination.

The Affective domain is of particular interest to this study because it describes a means in which students take the learning they experience and make it part of themselves. The Affective domain is broken down into a five-part taxonomy (Krathwohl, 1964). The first level, Receiving or attending, is the simplest level of affective response. It involves first awareness of the stimuli, then willingness to continue receiving the stimuli, and then finally controlled or selected attention to the stimuli. The next level is called Responding. In the first level of Responding, the individual shows acquiescence in responding to a stimulus by complying with expectations (e.g. obeying traffic laws). The next step is willingness to respond, in which a person responds with increased personal choice to a stimulus (e.g. voluntarily looks at a preferred type of visual art). The third
step in Responding is satisfaction in response, in which an individual responds emotionally to the stimuli.

The third level of the Affective domain is Valuing, which describes a more consistent behavioral pattern showing that the person holds a value. In the Valuing level, individuals first experience acceptance of a value, in which a person holds what might be called a “belief.” Next, the person shows a preference for a value, in which the individual actively furthers involvement in the activity, and finally commitment or conviction to the value. The fourth level, Organization, begins to internalize the value into a system. The first step is conceptualization of a value (e.g. the desire to evaluate a musical style which is appreciated), followed by organization of a value system, such as weighing the value against other values held by the individual. The final level of the Affective domain is Characterization by a Value or a Value Complex. In this level, the individual responds consistently according to the value held. The first step is called generalized set, in which the individual views situations in terms of the value and revises judgments as necessary; and the second step is characterization, in which the individual “develops a consistent philosophy of life” (Krathwohl et al, 1964, p. 35).

The valuing dimension of the Affective domain is of particular interest to this study, describing how students show personal motivation to pursue meaningful experiences in a specific area, rather than participating merely out of compliance with expectations from teachers and parents. Students who show commitment to a belief or conviction are likely to express this commitment through behavior (Krathwohl, 1964, p. 140).
What is “meaning”?

When a student values something, we say that it is meaningful to him. Meaning can be ascribed to actions, activities, experiences, and objects according to their value placed on them by the individual. Because meaning is often based on one’s personal perspective, the individualized nature of meaning is an important consideration to this study.

From earliest times, philosophers such as Socrates, Plato, and Aristotle have discussed the role of meaning in human endeavors. Aristotle, for example, theorized that the purpose of an action had much to do with the meaning an individual attributed to it.

A good deal depends on the purpose for which acts are done or subjects are studied. Anything done to satisfy a personal need, or to help a friend, or to attain goodness, will not be illiberal; but the very same act, when done repeatedly at the insistence of other persons, may be counted menial and servile. (Barker, 1961, p. 334)

Dewey spoke to the idiosyncratic nature of individual perceptions of activities in his 1916 work, Democracy and Education:

Nothing is more striking than the difference between an activity as merely physical and the wealth of meanings which the same activity may assume. From the outside, an astronomer gazing through a telescope is like a small boy looking through the same tube. In each case, there is an arrangement of glass and metal, and eye, and a little speck of light in the distance. Yet, at a critical moment, the activity of an astronomer might be concerned with the birth of a world, and have whatever is known about the starry heavens as its significant content. . . . There is no limit to the meaning which an action may come to possess. It all depends on the context of perceived connections in which it is placed; the reach of the imagination in realizing connections is inexhaustible. (p. 243)

For Rogers (1969), the value of an experience is an individual expression of meaning and may change according to a person’s circumstances.
The valuing process which seems to develop . . . is fluid, flexible, based on this particular moment, and the degree to which this moment is experienced as enhancing and actualizing. Values are not held rigidly, but are continually changing. The painting which last year seemed meaningful now appears uninteresting; the way of working with individuals which was formerly experienced as good now seems inadequate; the belief which then seemed true is now experienced as only partly true, or perhaps false…. It is his own experience which provides the value information or feedback. (pp. 248-249)

Meyer (1956) pointed out that meaning is not found intrinsically in objects, but in the individual’s interaction with them.

Meaning is thus not a property of things. It cannot be located in the stimulus alone. The same stimulus may have many different meanings. To a geologist a large rock may indicate that at one time a glacier began to recede at a given spot; to a farmer the same rock may point to the necessity of having the field cleared for plowing; and to the sculptor the rock may indicate the possibility of artistic creation. A rock, a word, or motion in and of itself merely as a stimulus, is meaningless. (p. 34)

Meaning In Education

In educational settings, the meaning students find in their learning can be the deciding factor in whether information is retained or forgotten. In Freedom to Learn (1969) Rogers discussed the difference between learning that is meaningless, such as rote memorization of facts without context and which “does not involve feelings or personal meanings,” and learning that is meaningful: that which has significance to the learner. Rogers asserts that for learning to be meaningful to students, it must meet their individual needs, rather than “…basing the instruction on the elements which have meaning for the teacher” (p. 5).
Involving students in the process of designing curricula and in assessing outcomes can make learning more meaningful. Leonhard and House (1972) noted that meaningful learning experiences are necessary. “. . . Without meaning there can be no learning. The meaning may be obscure of scanty, or it may be of an entirely different order than we intend it, but meaning of some kind is an essential ingredient of learning” (p. 122).

Bills (1975) contended that meaningful learning increased student involvement effort, writing that values influence behavior.

If I believe something is really important, I will probably work to get it. But if it is unimportant to me, I will not put forth my best effort. People usually modify their behavior in the manner they believe is required to help them obtain that which is important to them. (p. 5)

According to Woodruff (1970), learning that is most rewarding and makes a lasting impression on students involves both the Cognitive and Affective domains—knowledge as well as feelings. He wrote:

Our affective preferences and tastes (our values) grow out of our satisfaction or annoyance with our experiences with things, concurrent with our understandings of them. In any learning situation, students are experiencing both meanings and feelings simultaneously, and their concepts and value patterns reflect those meanings and feelings. (p. 54)

Meaningful learning experiences can encourage students’ best efforts and make learning more lasting. Meaning is derived from the value assigned to actions, activities, and experiences students encounter in their schooling, filtered through each individual’s unique ideas and perspectives. Because every student has different experiences on which
they base their perspectives, learning situations may hold different meanings for different students.

Meaning and the Arts

Throughout the human experience, people have sought meaning through the pursuit of the arts. Artistic endeavors, including visual art, dance, theatre arts, and music, allow individuals to express themselves as well as realize the intentions of other artists. In addition, the arts can be used to help facilitate student learning in the Affective domain. Through education in the arts, students can reach affective goals such as responding to artistic ideas, developing appreciation and preferences, and integrating the artistic values into their own lives (Krathwohl, 1964). Meaningful experiences in the arts, therefore, are important to students’ development in this domain.

In the visual arts, meaning can be expressed through the depiction of life events or by more abstract representation of artistic ideas. Artists that depict situations of “life-relevance” borrow or co-opt feelings associated with life-events — birth, death, war, love — and express emotion or impart ideas about those events (Hospers, 1946, p. 99). Meaning in abstract art works can be more difficult to codify: related to life yet not representational of a single emotion, event, or idea. Hospers wrote:

Most critics would refuse to call these “irrelevant to life”; yet they would also refuse not to call them great art. As we have already found in the case of music, they provide experiences different from any life-experience and hence unique, yet not wholly unrelated to it and hence not isolated (p. 117).

Stecker (1947) wrote that while realizing the artist’s interpretation of their work is important to understanding the meaning of a piece of art, it may not be the only meaning
that exists in the work. He noted that other acceptable value in a work could include
“…maximizing aesthetic enjoyment, making a work relevant to a new audience, [and] attempting to see the work through the eyes of its original or an ideal audience” (p. 116).

Meaning in Music

As an auditory art form, music is a unique branch of the arts. Scholars and researchers have searched for the meaning of music-making in humans. In addition, much debate exists regarding how composers express meaning through sound as well as how this meaning is experienced by the listener.

Several authors have hypothesized about the function of music in human society. Merriam (1964) wrote that music is a universal human behavior, a defining trait of man, and created a list of ten functions of music in all human cultures (pp. 219-227):

1. Emotional expression
2. Aesthetic enjoyment
3. Entertainment
4. Communication
5. Symbolic representation
6. Physical response
7. Enforcing conformity
8. Validation of social institutions and religious rituals
9. Contribution to the continuity and stability of cultures
10. Contribution to the integration of society

Gaston (1968) also listed eight “fundamental considerations” of the musical experience (pp. 21-27):

1. Need for aesthetic expression and experience.
2. The cultural matrix determines the mode of expression.
3. Music and religion are integrally related.
4. Music is communication.
5. Music is structured reality.
6. Music is derived from the tender emotions.
7. Music is a source of gratification.
8. The potency of music is greatest in the group
Maslow, noted for his hierarchy of human needs, believed that music was one way of discovering one’s identity and moving toward self-actualization. Speaking at the Tanglewood Symposium in 1967, he said:

…it happens that music and dancing and rhythm are excellent ways of moving toward the discovering of identity. We are built in such a fashion that this kind of trigger, this kind of stimulation, tends to do all kinds of things to our autonomic nervous systems, endocrine glands, to our feelings, and to our emotions. It just does. We just do not know enough about physiology to understand why it does. But it does, and these are unmistakable experiences. . . . This is a path, one of the ways that we try to teach self-actualization and the discovery of self. (Choate, 1968, p. 73)

Radocy and Boyle (1979) noted that musical meaning could be separated into two general categories: “…those related to the structural (collative) characteristics of the musical stimulus, and (2) those related to the listener, particularly the experiential variable” (p. 214-215). Bingham (1927) also believed that much of musical experience depended on the individual listener. “…the two major determiners of musical response are the musical selection itself, on the one hand, and on the other, the listener” (Schoen, p. 2).

Meyer (1956) theorized that most musical meaning comes from the individual interacting with the musical work. He wrote that a person’s prior experience with a musical style creates expectations which then create meaning. “Embodied musical meaning” for Meyer had much to do with the expectations of the listener. He explained that certain musical gestures lead the listener to expect a resulting musical occurrence, based on past experience with a musical style. Music in a style that was completely unfamiliar to the listener was thought to be meaningless. Meyer believed that as long as
listeners had previous experience with a style, most music could be viewed as meaningful.

In summary, meaning in the arts is rarely as simple as the meaning of a word or sentence, or the meaning of an action. The ambiguity inherent in art is one factor that makes the arts a unique discipline. Though scholars disagree on how the meaning of art should be interpreted, whether as abstract meaning or as a commentary on life, most would agree that art is an integral part of culture, part of what makes us uniquely human. Meaningful music experiences can be part of shaping personal identity, and music can be made more meaningful for the listener through repeated experience with a musical work or style.

Meaning in Music Education

Just as music occurs in almost every human society, music has been a part of education for centuries. Even the earliest philosophers and educators have expressed their beliefs about the importance of learning music and how music education benefits students and society. In music education, scholars have debated the purpose of teaching music and what outcomes were desired. Philosophers such as Reimer (1970) and Kneiter (1971) believed that the goal of music education should be to increase students’ sensitivity to music through activities designed to facilitate learning in the affective domain. To this end, the Tanglewood Symposium, an important collaboration of musicians, educators, and researchers, defined the role of music in society in terms of affective and aesthetic outcomes. The Tanglewood Declaration, written by participants Allen Britton, Arnold Broido, and Charles Gary, stated, “The arts afford a continuity with the aesthetic tradition
in man’s history. Music and other fine arts . . . reach close to the social, psychological, and physiological roots of man in his search for identity and self-realization” (Choate, 1968, p. 139).

Proponents of aesthetic education believe that the primary purpose of music education is to increase students’ aesthetic sensitivity. Knieter (1971) described an aesthetic experience as involving focus, perception, affect, cognition, and cultural matrix. Knieter believed that during an aesthetic experience those five separate components act together simultaneously. The respondent concentrates on the stimulus, has thoughts and feelings, and evaluates the occurrence based on past experiences and cultural framework. The aesthetic experience may encompass a wide range of emotions and degrees, from mild to intense.

Reimer (1970) believed that attention by educators to non-musical outcomes of music education was both damaging to students and to the profession, stating “…when teachers foster nonmusical experiences of music, when they give the impression that such experiences are what music is essentially for, when they prevent aesthetic experiences from taking place (let alone helping aesthetic experiences to take place), they are being nonmusic educators and are helping to produce nonmusical people” (1970, p. 94). Instead, Reimer encouraged teachers to move their students toward a heightened perception of music’s aesthetic qualities in order to prompt an affective response.
David Elliott (1995) holds a different view music education’s purpose than do Kneiter and Reimer, termed a “praxial philosophy of music education” (p. 61). He believes that music is an active process and that music is not just a collection of sounds, but of actions. To describe this, he introduces the term “musicing” to describe this active process. To Elliott, active music making is at the heart of musicianship. He believes music educators should concern themselves with designing authentic, appropriate music making activities that develop students’ musicianship. In Elliott’s praxial philosophy, music as a process or an activity takes precedence over music as a concept or an object. As philosophers debated the aesthetic and affective goals of music education, other proponents of music education turned towards a more utilitarian view of music. As assessment became a focus in public schools, with goals, standards, and measurable outcomes, music learning experiences took on a functional, supportive role in many public schools. For some, music education was valued for what it could do for students, particularly for its effects on learning in other subjects.

In the United States, music education began as a functional endeavor: the first music teaching in the colonies grew out of the need to teach church singers how to properly sing hymns. The Singing Schools began to be established around 1720, starting in Boston and spreading to the other colonies. The singing schools taught both singing
and the “art of music reading” (Birge, 1966), and until public school music programs began, the singing schools were one of the only means of formal music instruction in the United States. As Mark (1978) noted, the singing schools success lied not just in their ability to achieve musical goals, but “…social purposes as well. People enjoyed singing, and appreciated the pleasant social atmosphere created by learning music and singing together” (p. 5).

The singing-school made a definite impression on Lowell Mason, who went on to become the first noted public school music teacher in the United States. Upon arriving in Boston, Mason set out to improve the quality of both singing-school teaching and choral singing itself. This led to the establishment of the Boston Academy of Music and eventually to the teaching of vocal music in Boston public schools. It was believed that music instruction in schools would benefit students by providing a means to “…humanize, refine, and elevate a whole community” (Birge, 1966, p. 47). It was hoped by many that by instructing young children in music, the students would reap benefits later in life. “The advantages to be gained from instructing children in vocal music. . . bear upon their characters, employments and recreations in after years– upon their condition as social and domestic beings” (p. 52). Other authors, however, cautioned the overstatement of nonmusical effects of music and music education. Davies (1978) stated,
“Such traits as self-discipline, social awareness are taught, it is claimed, by a proper musical education. Unfortunately, there is very little to support such claims, and for the most part, they remain matters of idealistic belief” (p. 23).

To gain more empirical evidence for music’s ability to support learning and social goals, researchers have sought to identify ways in which music education assists in the mastery of other school subjects. Cutietta, Hamann, and Walker (1995) investigated the current research on extramusical “spin-offs” of music education in reading and language, mathematics, social and psychological health, and motor skills. In their analysis of numerous research studies, they reported that 1) musical skills are related to reading and language skills; 2) musical skills are related to mathematical and other academic skills; 3) music study can enhance students’ creativity, decrease dropout rates, and have a positive effect on students’ self-esteem, self-image, and social interactions; and 4) some types of active music participation by students can help improve motor abilities. Though the authors did not imply that music education was a causal factor in many of these nonmusical outcomes, they did attest to the fact that music appears an integral part of a well-rounded education, relating closely to other academic areas.

One common trend in music education is that of “arts integration.” In this philosophy, the arts are interwoven with other school subjects, primarily for their ability
to clarify and enhance learning in these other areas. Integrated arts programs typically bring musicians or other artists into classrooms to perform for students and to combine music-making activities with other learning situations, such as reading or mathematics activities. These arts integration programs are a prime example of the functional use of music in the public schools.

Opening Minds Through the Arts (OMA), an arts integration program in Tucson, Arizona, was developed to make the arts a integral part of several elementary schools. Musicians make regular classroom visits and work with classroom teachers to support learning goals and increase academic achievement, particularly with “at-risk” children.

According to the OMA website:

Music is an excellent tool to help children assimilate all other classroom activities into a general knowledge base. Verbal communication and written language are both symbolic systems used to translate knowledge to the brain. Music is the natural vehicle to make learning more significant for children.” (n.d.)

The Chicago Arts Partnerships in Education (CAPE) serves students in Chicago public schools, with the goal of improving academic achievement and school climate. According to their website, “The arts, when introduced through integrated instruction as well as discipline-specific study, can be an essential element to school improvement” (n.d.). Similar arts integration programs are in place in schools across the country.
Programs such as these speak to the current efforts by school administrators and educators to improve student achievement. The arts, believed by many to have powers to augment learning and enhance classroom climate, seem a natural fit for schools wishing to meet achievement goals. Arts integration programs assess the success of music experiences through cognitive outcomes across the curriculum, and are an excellent example of music education’s functional use.

Need:

Although the subjects of music and music education have been studied by thoughtful educators, philosophers, and aestheticians, little agreement has been reached about exactly what outcomes should result from music education and how best to assess these outcomes. Though most authors can agree on objective outcomes of musical skills and knowledge (such as in music history, music theory, etc.) as well as how to assess these outcomes, much less certainty exists regarding affective outcomes in music education. Specifically, little research presently exists regarding the assessment of outcomes other than those of traditional skills and knowledge. Is music education able to effectively increase students’ aesthetic, affective, or personal abilities, and do other outcomes exist that are not currently measured?
How are these outcomes assessed?

Krathwohl et al (1964) pointed out that many educators are hesitant to assess students in their individual processes of valuing and other affective behaviors. “Teachers and examiners do not regard it as appropriate to grade students with respect to their interests, attitude, or character development” (p. 17). However, Krathwohl et al noted that there should be a distinction made between providing education in the affective domain and indoctrinating students according to the teachers’ beliefs. “True education,” they wrote, is a process which allows individuals to make informed decisions and choose freely, whereas indoctrination is an attempt by teachers to force students into a certain behavior or belief. Krathwohl et al wrote that as long as teachers of affective education refrained from indoctrination, then it was appropriate to teach toward affective goals and assess students on affective outcomes (p. 18).

Ernst and Gary (1965) described desirable outcomes in music education as skills, understandings, and attitudes (p. 4-8), but as Krathwohl et al noted, assessment of objectives in the affective domain can be challenging. To this end, the National Assessment of Educational Progress (Norris & Bowes, 1970) addressed the evaluation of music instruction in the affective domain, creating some affective goals and objectives.
Importance of involving students in assessment process

Affective goals, admittedly difficult to design and assess, also may differ according to individual students’ needs and experiences. As educators design programs that propose to meet affective goals, it becomes necessary to understand the individual perspectives of students in order to best meet their needs. However, little research exists that involves students in the process of evaluating their educational experiences.

Rogers (1983) asserted that many educators do not take the time to discover what meaning students find in their personal and educational experiences.

. . . Another question I would ask myself would be, “What are the interests, goals, aims, purposes, passions of these students?” I would want to ask the question not only collectively, but individually. What are the things that excite them, and how can I find out? . . . . how rarely it comes across to a student that a teacher really wants to know some of the motives and interests that make the student tick (pp. 139-140).

Rogers points to the “absence of feedback” as one problem facing educational institutions (p. 306). He advocated surveying students about their educational experiences at the end of elementary school, high school, college, and then again three to five years later, using an anonymous questionnaire. Rogers believed that such feedback would let educators know how the environment and curricula were being received and assimilated by the student. In addition, he noted that such a process could help the students feel that they have more control over the direction of their own education (p. 306).
Presently, a need exists to determine the meaningfulness of music education to students in non-performance classrooms. Though researchers, educators, and philosophers have all developed valuable theories about the meaning of music education, little empirical research exists on students’ perspectives on their own musical education. In addition, few means exist to assess the affective outcomes of education in the arts.

Understanding the meaningfulness of music education can help educators develop better educational opportunities for their students by bringing the students’ perspectives to light. By understanding the value students find in their musical experiences, educators can better meet individual students’ needs, develop more meaningful curricula for students in non-performance classrooms, and perhaps use this information as a means for justifying continued support for public school music programs.

Purpose:

The purpose of this study was to investigate the meaning of music education to middle school general music students. For this study, “meaning” is defined as “a psychological construct with cognitive and affective aspects, manifested overtly through behavior, reflecting an individual’s evaluation and valuing of an experience” (Hylton, 1980).

Specifically, this study addresses the following questions:

1. What meaning do middle school general music students derive from their musical education?

2. Do underlying dimensions exist in this meaning? If these dimensions do exist, what are they and what relationships exist among them?
Operational Definitions

The following words and phrases are defined for use in the present study:

Affective Domain: “That area of learning emphasizing feeling, emotion or interests, attitudes, and values” (Krathwohl et al, 1964, p. 7).

Attitude: “A predisposition to action, organized around an object or situation” (Hylton, 1980, p. 20).

Belief: “The conviction that something is true or that something is right” (Webster’s Dictionary, 1989, p. 88).

Cognitive Domain: “That area of learning dealing with recall or recognition of knowledge and development of intellectual abilities and skills” (Bloom et al, 1956, p. 7).

Meaning: “A psychological construct with cognitive and affective aspects, manifested overtly through behavior, reflecting an individual’s evaluation and valuing of an experience” (Hylton, 1980, p. 20)

Value: “The measure of how strongly something is desired, especially expressed in terms of the effort one is willing to expend in acquiring, retaining possession of, or preserving it” (Webster’s Dictionary, 1989, p. 1087).

Overview of Remaining Chapters:

This study is organized into five chapters, plus a bibliography and appendices. In chapter one we find an introduction to the study, including the theoretical framework, need, purpose, and definition of terms. In chapter two a review of related literature is presented, pertaining to student views of music education, including measures of attitude, qualitative views, and students’ beliefs about music education.
In chapter three the methodology that will be used in the study is detailed. Creation of the instrument to be used, as well as the piloting of the instrument and the administration of the instrument will be discussed. The sample, methods, and means of analysis will also be found in chapter three. In chapter four we find the results of the study, including the interpretation of the factor analysis. In chapter five a discussion of the findings is presented, as well as implications for music education, related to previous research. The references and appendices will mark the concluding section of the document. The appendices will contain all correspondence with participants, student responses to the open-ended questions and the survey instrument(s), and other related documents.
CHAPTER 2
REVIEW OF LITERATURE

The review of related research is divided into five major areas, focusing on the perspective of students concerning their schooling experience. First, student perspectives on school in general, and some specific academic disciplines, are considered. In section two, research is reviewed that relates to student perspectives on arts education: visual art, theatre, and dance. In section three the focus is on student perspectives on music education, without regard to grade level or type of music class. In section four, research is reviewed that relates to student perspectives on general music — that is, non-performance based courses that feature a variety of music learning activities. In section five the focus of the review is on student views of general music in the middle school or junior high school. The chapter ends with a discussion of the implications of these studies to the current study and summarizes the major findings of the chapter.

Student perspectives on school:

When one seeks to discover the meaning of the school experience, the perspectives of those who directly experience schooling, the students, are critical. Students hold a variety of views regarding education, some general and some discipline-specific, that can help educators better understand the nature of life in classrooms. Though research into student perspectives on schooling is less prevalent than the perspectives of educators and others, researchers that focus on student views of education offer valuable information about the nature of the student experience.
Using data collected in a 1980 national survey on secondary education, High School and Beyond (HS&B), sponsored by the National Center for Education Statistics, Lee & Bryk (1986) investigated the effects of single-sex schooling on academic and social attitudes, school-related behaviors, course enrollment, educational goals, locus of control, self-concept; and sex role attitudes. The sample was comprised of tenth-grade and twelfth-grade students attending all-girls’ or all-boys’ Catholic Schools in 1980. Thirty-six tenth-grade students and 36 twelfth-grade students were chosen from each of 1015 Catholic schools, for a total N = 73,080. These students were compared to a similar sample of students attending coeducational schools. The tenth-grade students from 1980 were also re-evaluated as twelfth-graders in 1982; the data reported here are from those 1982 findings. The researchers found that in girls’ schools, the students consistently showed more positive attitudes toward school than did peers in coeducational schools. In addition, the students in the all-girls’ school showed a statistically significant positive effect for educational aspirations, as well as senior-year locus of control and sophomore year self-concept. In all-boys’ schools, attitudes were also positive, though not as high as the attitudes of female students in all-girls’ schools. Students in all-boys' schools were much more likely to enroll in a larger number of mathematics and science courses and were less likely than their coeducational-school counterparts to enroll in vocational courses. Both male and female students in all-girls’ or all-boys’ schools reported higher satisfaction with the teaching quality of their instructors and higher overall satisfaction with their schools.
In their article “Major Influences on Attitudes toward Science,” Papanastasiou & Papanastasiou (2004) investigated the attitudes of 8th grade students in Australia, Canada, Cyprus, and Korea toward science and science education. A total of 15,900 students from the four countries were surveyed using a 4-point rating scale regarding their attitudes toward science, class activities in science, school climate, family educational background, level of aspiration. It was found that the quality of teaching had the largest influence on students’ attitudes toward science. Level of aspiration was second highest influence: students whose families and peers valued science tended to have more positive attitudes toward science and science education. School climate and educational background of parents were shown not to highly influence attitudes towards science.

In research comparing American and Taiwanese children’s attitudes and achievement in mathematics, Tsao (2004) compared 37 fifth-grade students from Taipei, Taiwan with 21 fifth-graders from Denver. Using a 39-question survey with a 7-point rating scale, Tsao investigated students’ perceptions of what mathematics entailed, how to learn math, and student motivation for math, among other things. The author found cultural differences between the two nationalities of students; for example, American students believed strongly that in mathematics, problems were either right or wrong while Taiwanese students felt partially-right or partially-wrong answers were possible. The researcher also found that Taiwanese students responded positively to negative motivation for success such as fear of punishment, whereas American students were more motivated by positive outcomes such as impressing the teacher or wanting to do well in class.
Darling, Caldwell, & Smith (2005) investigated the effect of participation in extracurricular activities (ECAs) on various factors relating to the adjustment and attitudes of high school students. Two thousand four hundred and sixty two students in six California high schools responded to a questionnaire regarding their self-reported participation in ECAs, drug and alcohol use, academic aspirations, and attitudes toward school. Students who participated in extracurricular activities reported better grades, higher academic goals, and more positive attitudes towards school than students who did not participate in ECAs.

In a study focusing on college students’ perspectives on their general education courses, Twombly (1992) used questionnaires, individual interviews, and focus group interviews with university and community college students in the Midwest. Subjects’ interpretations of the purposes of general education (general courses outside the declared major) were grouped into four general categories: educational (becoming “well-rounded”), instrumental (developing confidence and discipline), personal (better understanding of the self), and negative (waste of time). Twombly determined that the two major factors that influenced the students’ opinions concerning general education were the students’ perceptions of the need for the courses later in life, and the influence of others concerning the importance of general education, such as from parents, siblings, advisors, and teachers.

Tannehill and Zakrajsek (1993) surveyed 366 students in grades 6 through 12 concerning their attitudes towards physical education. The researchers focused on the attitudes of the students in three urban communities towards five variables: physical
education goals, likes and dislikes regarding physical education, the importance of physical education to their overall education, values developed in physical education, and positive/negative experiences in physical education. The researchers used a 5-point Likert-type scale as well as open-ended questions to gather students’ responses. Tannehill and Zakrajsek noted that 52% of subjects participated in sports activities, and reported that students believed physical education to be important to their overall education. Subjects reported the positive aspects of physical education to be winning, success, teamwork, and having fun, and negative aspects to be sport-related injuries and dislike of fitness exercises.

In 1998, Haney, Russell, Gulek and Fierros used reflection surveys and student drawings to gain insight into middle school students’ perspectives on classroom practices. They found that students documented school changes through their drawings. The researchers concluded that drawing could be a powerful means for students to express their views of schooling.

In summary, students appeared to believe education was important to their lives, particularly in regard to preparing for college or employment. Students believed that general courses helped them to become well-rounded and self-disciplined. Students also expressed opinions about specific subjects such as physical education, math, and science. In these studies, it was shown that attitudes toward school and specific school subjects related to a variety of factors, including quality of teaching and peer and family influence.
Student perspectives on arts education

In the arts, students are often encouraged to be creative and express themselves through creating art. Given the arts’ potential for allowing student self-expression and creativity, researchers have sought to discover whether courses in the arts result in meaningful learning for students. Researchers have found that while many students often did experience meaningful learning in the arts, others questioned the value of art with regard to their vocational aspirations.

Gregory, Bosseau, and Delgado (1995) studied the attitudes and academic achievement of 150 Black and Hispanic students participating in the Arts Integration Program, developed by New Jersey’s The Whole Theatre Inc. The students participated in an 8-month workshop using role-playing and improvisation. In the culmination of the workshop, students wrote, staged, and acted out an original play. At the conclusion of the program, the subjects reported improved attitudes about themselves and others, as well as improved attitudes regarding self-expression, self-acceptance, acceptance of others, self-awareness, and empowerment, as compared to their attitudes prior to the program. The authors concluded, “The improvisational dramatics program…provides a method for improving attitudes which may be related to achievement” (p. 63).

Stinson (1995) investigated the perspectives on schooling of high school students involved in school dance classes. The researcher observed and interviewed 36 dance students regarding their reasons for taking a dance class, opinions of their teachers, attitudes towards their learning experience, and their goals and expectations for after high school. Stinson found that the students’ view of dance class was markedly different from
their overall view of high school. Students described their high school courses as “boring” and “stifling” and spoke of uncaring teachers and disruptive classmates. In contrast, students viewed their dance classes much more positively, citing caring instructors, close relationships among students, and the opportunity for self-expression as positive elements of their educational experience. Students viewed dance class as a way to escape from the pressures of school. The students did not, however, believe that dance class was helpful to them in regard to entering college or getting a job, seeing no “educational value” in elective courses like dance.

To summarize the research relating to student perspectives on arts education, students viewed the arts as important to their experience in school, particularly when the art forms allowed for self-expression. Research subjects found that theatre education could help increase their awareness of themselves and others. Students involved in high school dance classes felt that the classroom environment in their dance classes was more positive than that of their other high school courses, but also felt that the class did not directly prepare them for life after high school.

Student perspectives on Music Education

Students in elementary and secondary schools hold a variety of perspectives concerning their music classes. Some of their attitudes appear to be related to age and grade level, while others are affected by factors such as musical self-esteem, behavior of the teacher, and the musical activities used in class.

Students’ age and grade level appear to have a strong effect on their attitudes toward music classes. A number of researchers have reported that attitudes pertaining to
music classes tended to decrease with advancing grade level (Broquist, 1964; Nolin, 1967 & 1973). Broquist (1964) surveyed 2,594 Wisconsin students in grades two through six concerning their liking for various music education activities. He found that student attitudes towards school music steadily decreased in favorableness from second to sixth grade.

In a “partial replication and modification” of Broquist’s study, Nolin (1967) found a decrease in students’ attitudes from fifth to sixth grade. In 1973, Nolin attempted to further delineate where the decrease in attitudes occurred. He surveyed 2,264 Midwestern students, grades 3-6, regarding their opinions of various aspects of their school music program. The students responded to each statement with one of four possible responses: (1) I like it; (2) It’s ok; (3) I don’t like it; or (4) I don’t remember doing it. A numerical value was assigned to each response, giving each student a number value. The number value was called the student’s “Musical Attitude Quotient” or MAQ. Nolin found that both male and female students’ MAQ declined from third to sixth grade. Students rated playing instruments highly, as well as playing rhythm games and dancing. Poorly rated activities included studying famous composers, listening to symphony recordings, and music-reading activities.

As Nolin (1973) reported, there appeared to be a relationship between activities used in music classes and students’ attitudes towards music classes. Hulbert (1972) surveyed college students concerning their perspectives on their school music experiences in grades four through nine. Using a Likert-type scale, subjects rated 73 music activities. Hulbert’s subjects reported that they preferred different activities in
different grade levels. The college-age subjects remembered preferring rhythmic activities and singing in grades four through six, while in junior high the subjects preferred more passive activities such as listening and music appreciation.

Musical self-esteem, a measure of how one views one’s musical talent and ability, appears to relate to students’ feelings concerning music class. Austin (1990) surveyed 252 fifth and sixth grade students regarding the degree to which they participated in musical activities in school and out-of-school. The students’ level of musical self-esteem, assessed by the Self-Esteem of Musical Ability scale, (Schmitt, 1979) was also measured. Austin reported that fifth and sixth grade students’ level of musical self-esteem was a significant predictor of participation in musical activities in and out of school. It was found that students who had higher levels of music self-esteem tended to involve themselves in more music activities.

Teachers appear to have a great effect on the students they instruct: not only with regard to educational outcomes, but also on students’ attitudes towards classes and class subject matter. Murray (1972) investigated teacher approval/disapproval conditions with high school choral students. Using an experimental design, the researcher manipulated the amount of approval vs. disapproval the teachers gave the students and measured student attitudes under each condition. Murray found that student attitudes toward class were significantly higher under an 80% teacher approval condition than under a 20% teacher approval condition.

Adderly, Kennedy, and Berz (2003) explored the environment of a high school music classroom and attempted to assess students’ perspectives pertaining to their music
education experience. Using structured interviews, the researchers gathered information from 60 students in a Northeastern, suburban high school: 20 students each from the school band, choir, and orchestra programs. The researchers found that students participated in school music ensembles for a variety of reasons from family influence, enjoyment of music, performing, and social benefits. Students found music-making and performing to be meaningful, as well as the acquisition of musical skills and knowledge. The students also felt they were gaining psychological benefits from their involvement in music groups, such as increased responsibility, self-discipline, and personal growth, and that music-making provided an emotional outlet and a comfortable classroom atmosphere.

Hylton (1980) investigated the meaning of the high school choral experience for student participants. Hylton administered a researcher-created survey to 673 high school choral students in Pennsylvania. He asked students to respond to statements regarding what aspects of the choral singing experience were meaningful to them. Using a Likert-type scale, students rated each statement according to how much value it had for them. Using a factor-analysis procedure, the statements were organized into six dimensions. These dimensions were identified as: achievement, spiritualistic, musical-artistic, communicative, psychological, and integrative. From these data, Hylton determined that the subjects felt high school choral singing was a meaningful, multifaceted experience, producing multiple outcomes.

To summarize the literature relating to student perspectives on music education, researchers have found that attitudes towards music classes decrease as children advance
in grade level, particularly between grades three and six. Music students appear to prefer active music making, such as playing instruments and moving to music, and rated music theory and history activities poorly. Students found their musical involvement to be meaningful, believing they gained self-discipline and responsibility from music education. Some students’ views of music education could be grouped into underlying dimensions, such as achievement, communicative, or psychological aspects.

**Student perspectives on General Music classes**

Students in general music courses report similar perspectives on music education as do students in other types of music classes. Researchers have found that attitudes towards general music courses tend to decrease as students get older. In addition, students tend to prefer activities such as playing instruments and listening to music more than music theory and history lessons.

In 1980, Vander Ark, Nolin, and Newman investigated the relationship between music attitudes of general music students and variables such as sex, self-esteem, grade level, and social status. The subjects were elementary general music students in grades three through six attending Midwestern, suburban schools. The subjects were administered a battery of measures, including the Musical Attitude Inventory (Nolin, 1973) and Coopersmith’s Self-Esteem Inventory (1967). Information was gathered about the students’ families through the North-Hatt Occupation Prestige Scale (1947). The authors found that attitudes towards music class decreased significantly with each advancing grade level, and that self-esteem was a significant predictor of attitude toward music class. The authors discovered that students from middle social-status families had
significantly higher attitudes toward music class than low or high social status students. The authors also reported that general music students enjoyed singing, listening, and playing instruments, but rated music reading activities poorly.

Philips and Aichison (1998) conducted a two-year longitudinal study of general music students beginning in third grade through the fourth grade, investigating musical aptitude, musical knowledge, and attitudes pertaining to music class. Eighty-five rural Midwestern students participated in twice-weekly group singing lessons with the researchers over 27 weeks of instruction. At the end of the investigation period, the students were administered tests of musical aptitude, musical knowledge, and attitude towards singing and general music. It was found that only 39% of students surveyed said they liked the singing lessons, and only 28% of students liked general music class. The authors suggested that attitudes towards singing were declining among upper-elementary students, supporting previous findings by Mizener (1993) and Philips and Aitchison (1998), who noted that grade level was a predictor of attitudes toward music education.

To summarize literature relating to student perspectives on general music, findings in general music are similar to those in other areas of music education. Students’ attitudes are related to the activities in which they participate. Students enjoy playing instruments, some students enjoy singing but many do not, and music reading activities are generally poorly rated. Attitudes towards general music appear to be related to grade level, with younger students reporting a more positive attitude toward music classes than older students. Students’ attitudes regarding music classes also seem to be related to their levels of musical self-esteem.
Student Perspectives on Middle School/Junior High General Music Education

In music education, research has been conducted primarily with the youngest students (elementary students) or the older public school students (those in high school performance groups), as well as students in college courses. Middle school students have been surveyed far less. In order to truly understand the relationship of grade level and attitude toward music education, it is necessary to sample students at all levels, including those in middle school. Ebie, (2002) in his survey of fifty years of the Journal of Research in Music Education, found that only 89 samples in the JRME represented middle school or junior high populations, as opposed to 212 elementary samples and 104 high school samples. Middle school general music is particularly underrepresented: of the 89 middle school junior high samples in Ebie’s survey, only three included specific mentions of general music. Researchers who have sampled middle school general music students have found that students’ perspectives on music education are influenced by variables such as gender roles, musical self-concept, home musical environment, and activities used.

Philips (n.d.) surveyed 102 seventh-grade students enrolled in a required general music course, in order to discover the correlation between music attitudes, gender, perception of gender roles in music, home musical environment, and self-concept in music. The subjects were administered four surveys: the Music Attitude Scale (Shaw & Tomcala, 1976), the Male and Female Connotations of Music scale (Svengalis, 1978), the Music Background measure (Svengalis, 1978), and the Self-concept in Music scale (Svengalis, 1978). Philips found that home musical environment was significantly related
to the music attitudes of the subjects, and that a high correlation existed between the music attitudes of the students and their self-concept in music. He also found that female subjects had more positive attitudes towards music, richer home musical environments, and significantly higher musical self-concepts than the male subjects.

Wig and Boyle (1982) investigated the effect of a keyboard-based learning approach on the attitudes of sixth-grade general music students. Six experimental groups using electronic keyboards were compared to six control groups that received a traditional general music approach using classroom instruments, singing, listening, and studying musicians and musical style. After twelve weeks of instruction, the students were administered the Music Achievement Tests (Colwell, 1969-1970) to measure gains in musical knowledge and skill, as well as changes in attitude toward music class as measured by the Music Attitude Survey (Wig & Boyle, 1982). The authors found that students in the experimental keyboard-based learning groups performed significantly better on the Music Achievement Tests than the students in the control groups. It was also found that students in the keyboard learning groups developed more positive attitudes toward their music class, their musical abilities, and their musical creativity than students using the traditional approach.

Boswell (1991) administered two surveys to 394 students attending four junior high and middle schools in suburban Arizona, to investigate what factors contributed to the students’ attitudes toward music class. Participants completed the Music Attitude Inventory (Pogonowski, 1982), which assessed student preferences for certain music activities, and the Music Class Attitude Index (Pogonowski, 1982), a global assessment
of attitudes toward music class. Boswell found that middle school girls showed higher attitudes toward music class than boys, and the students preferred activities that involved playing instruments. Subjects valued creative tasks such as improvisation more than singing or describing music, and ranked very highly any item including the words “choose” or “choice.” Boswell also noted that the teacher significantly affected students’ attitudes towards music class, even more than grade or gender.

Wayman (2004) investigated three 8th grade general music students’ beliefs pertaining to music education. Using one focused interview with each subject, the researcher explored the students’ attitudes towards music and the arts, as well as what meaning they found in their own musical education. Three themes emerged from the interview data. First, the students felt that music class was fun and provides needed stress relief, but the students did not view their music class as a serious academic subject. Second, the participants believed that some students were more musically talented than others and that music class was more important for the talented few. Third, the students felt that music was primarily a passive art form whose main purpose was entertainment.

Summary

In the last several decades, researchers have investigated student perspectives regarding their education. Students have viewed public education as important, especially for preparation for future endeavors such as going to college and getting jobs. Other values of education included the opportunity to become well-rounded and to gain self-discipline. Students viewed arts education as an opportunity for self-expression, a release of stress, and increased self-awareness. Many students’ perspectives on music education
changed based on subjects’ age or grade level, while others were affected by the types of activities involved in music class, musical self-esteem, and behavior of the teacher. Generally, students found performing activities to be most meaningful, compared to music reading and music history activities. Attitudes toward singing varied by grade level, gender, and teacher. Researchers in middle school/junior high general music found that students’ musical self-concept and home musical environment correlated with attitudes towards music class. Approaches such as keyboard-learning experiences were found to increase attitudes toward music class. It was also discovered that although students found music classes to provide a release of tension, students do not always view music classes as rigorous academic subjects.

Implications

The information provided in these studies is valuable in providing information about how students view their educational experiences, particularly their music education experiences. Further investigation of student perspectives towards music education is needed to assist educators’ understanding of students. A better knowledge of students’ perspectives can positively affect teachers’ interactions with students. Further research is needed using middle school students as subjects, due to the “research gap” regarding the use of middle school students. Specifically, a need presently exists for additional research with middle school students concerning their perspectives of the meaningfulness of music education.
CHAPTER 3
METHODOLOGY

This chapter is divided into five sections. In the first section, the sample used in the study is described and how they were chosen is detailed. The second section includes a description of the development of the instrument used, including the sample used in the instrument creation process, rationale for the process used in the instrument creation process, and the internal validity of the instrument. Section three features a description of the pilot study. Information regarding how the pilot survey was constructed is described, as well as how the pilot was administered and to whom, and concludes with a detailed description of the pilot data analysis process. In the fourth section, the procedures for the main study are detailed, including specific information about the sample, the consent process, and how the instrument was administered. In section five summary of the content of the chapter appears.

Sample

Data for this study were gathered in the spring of 2005. Participants were students attending public middle schools or junior high schools, grades 6, 7, and 8. Subjects were selected from 6 geographic locations across the United States, representing the 6 MENC districts: Eastern, North Central, Northwest, Southern, Southwestern, and Western. Students were selected from schools from each district based on three factors: 1) willingness to participate; 2) existence of a general music program in the school; and 3) ability to obtain site authorization from the school principal.

Teachers who were authorized by their administration and agreed to participate
were mailed a packet containing parental permission letters and Site Authorization materials. Students who were willing to complete the survey and who returned signed parental permission forms were administered the Music Meaning Survey, either in an electronic format via the computer or in traditional paper-and-pencil method. Student subjects remained anonymous and were identified only by school and grade level for organizational purposes. When all subjects completed the Music Meaning Survey (MMS), the teachers mailed the permission forms and surveys back to the researcher in a self-addressed stamped envelope.

Development of the Music Meaning Survey

An assessment instrument, titled the Music Meaning Survey, was developed to explore student perspectives pertaining to their experiences in music education. Little empirical research existed regarding student perspectives on their own musical education. Consequently, this study was proposed to discover students’ thoughts, feelings, attitudes towards music education. To develop statements for use in the MMS, subjects in the development phase were asked to respond in their own words to an open-ended question. Using students’ words in the instrument development phase was necessary for two primary reasons: to develop a survey instrument that accurately reflected student perspectives, and to gather honest, anonymous responses from students, rather than rely on researcher-generated ideas.

The instrument development phase was conducted in October through December, 2004. In this phase, participants (N = 178) attending 7 middle schools in 5 states (Alabama, Arizona, Iowa, Missouri, and South Carolina) were asked to respond to an
open-ended question about the meaningfulness of their music education experience.

Music teachers in districts who had middle school general music programs were emailed in order to determine their willingness to participate in this phase of the study.

Participants in this instrument development phase were asked to respond in their own words to this question:

Please take a minute to think about the time you have spent in school music classes. Please list your thoughts about what music class means to you. WHAT is important about music class, and WHY is it important to you?

The procedure in this phase was based on that of Hylton (1980) who generated statements concerning the meaning of the choral singing experience using similar methods. Hylton’s method was previously used by Gorlow & Schroeder (1968) to discover the meaning of religion, and by Farrell (1972) pertaining to recreational experience in music. The use of open-ended questions allowed for a range of subjects’ responses.

Students in selected general music classes were able to elect to participate voluntarily in the development phase. Students were assured that their participation in this phase would not affect their class grade nor their standing in their class in any way, and that they could withdraw at any time. Teachers were encouraged to develop an alternate activity for students who chose not to participate. Gender and socioeconomic status of the students were not considered in this phase.

Teachers were given instructions to read verbally to the students, and written instructions were also provided on the question sheet. Teacher instructions can be found in Appendix A. Subjects were encouraged to respond thoughtfully, honestly, and in as
much detail as possible. A copy of the instrument-development survey can be found in Appendix B. The 178 participants generated 670 responses. These responses were analyzed and then reduced to 147 relatively distinct statements of meaning. Included in Appendix C are all of the statements from the students. Appendix D features examples of students’ statements with the researcher’s re-wording for consistency. The students’ statements were rewritten in infinitive form, such as “to play instruments,” “to relax,” and “to talk to others.”

Responses were analyzed qualitatively by grouping the items with others that appeared similar. Seven broad general categories were revealed after a qualitative analysis: Psychological, Integrative, Communicative, Academic (non-musical), Academic (musical), Musical-Artistic, and Future Goals. The students’ statements arranged in these categories are found in Appendix E. These categories were described as follows:

Psychological: Statements in this category related to students’ sense of self, personality, identity, and their emotional development. Statements in this category included “To express my feelings,” “To bring meaning to life,” “To feel good about myself,” and “To learn not to be shy.”

Integrative: Statements in this category involved social interactions between individual students, groups of students and between students and teacher. Statements in this category included “To participate with a group of people,” “To share with someone else,” “To get encouragement,” and “To enjoy being with the teacher.”

Communicative: Statements in this category referred to using music to
communicate with others, primarily in the form of performing. Statements in this category included “To entertain people,” “To relax others by playing or singing to them,” “To perform for my family,” and “To share my talent with others.”

Academic (Non-Musical): This category included statements involving learning, thinking, and earning academic credits, and related more to music as a school subject rather than as an art form. Statements in this category included “To experience new things,” “To get smarter,” “To have a hands-on experience,” and “To learn things that might help in other classes.”

Academic (Musical): This category also referred to music as a school subject, but centered around the academic aspects of music class such as reading music and learning about composers, musical styles, and music history. Statements in this category included “To learn to read notes,” “To learn beats and rhythms,” “To learn about music from other countries,” and “To learn about composers.”

Musical-Artistic: In this category, statements referred to components of music class that involve active music-making, what Elliott (1995) called “musicing.” Statements in this category included “To sing,” “To listen to music,” “To play instruments,” and “To dance.”

Future Goals: Statements in this category described future outcomes of learning about music. Statements in this category included “To learn something you might use later in life,” “To be a singer as an adult,” “To get a job in the music business,” and “To play in a band someday.”
To summarize, the MMS was developed by using subjects’ own words, in response to the question, “What is important about music class, and why is it important to you?” The subjects’ statements were grouped with other similar statements using qualitative analysis. This analysis revealed 7 categories of statements: Psychological, Integrative, Communicative, Academic (non-musical), Academic (musical), Musical-Artistic, and Future Goals. In the next phase of the study, these statements were used in a pilot version of the MMS.

Description of the Pilot Study

After the survey development phase, the statements of meaning generated by subjects were organized into the pilot version of the MMS. The pilot MMS was used in order to test the instrument before it was used in the final phase of the study. In the pilot study, the pilot MMS was administered to a sample of students (N = 96) at Esperero Canyon Middle School in Tucson, Arizona, in order to test the clarity and usability of the MMS. In addition, the pilot MMS was used to obtain quantitative data for use in verifying the general categories of meaning which were qualitatively derived in the development phase. Additionally, categories or meanings were added, altered, or removed in the final MMS based upon the pilot data.

Two criteria were used to select statements for use in the pilot study. First, previous research relating to the preferences of students regarding music class were
considered. Second, statements were chosen that most clearly represented each of the seven categories detailed above. In all, fifteen statements were chosen from each of the seven categories, making 105 total statements in the pilot survey. The 105 statements, grouped in their categories, can be found in Appendix F. These representative statements were arranged in a random order for the pilot MMS. A four-point Likert-type scale was constructed, which students used to indicate how strongly they agreed with each of the statements about music class (1 = really disagree, 2 = sort of disagree, 3 = sort of agree, 4 = really agree). A copy of the pilot MMS can be found in Appendix G.

The results of the pilot survey were factor analyzed using principal components analysis and a varimax rotation. The factor analysis process is designed to group similar items together, for the purpose of determining what categories, or factors, exist within the data.

Description of the Factor Analysis process and Varimax rotation:

Factor analysis is a data-reduction technique used to remove duplicated information from a set of variables, which has the effect of grouping similar variables together. A large number of variables may cluster together in groups of similar items, which may represent a common theme or idea. Once grouped, a large number of individual items may be collected in only a few groups, making them easier to understand and interpret. The factor analysis procedure produces a correlation matrix, which systematically arranges the correlation coefficients for each combination of two variables
(variable 1 with variable 2, variable 1 with variable 3, variable 1 with variable 4) until a correlation coefficient is obtained for each possible pair. This correlation matrix is then manipulated using matrix algebra, the result of which is the factor matrix. In the factor matrix, columns represent each derived category or factor, and rows represent the original variables. In the case of the MMS, the variables are the survey statements.

The resulting cells contain a number called a factor loading, from –1.00 to +1.00, which represents how much each variable correlates with each of the factors. These factor loadings tell us how much each statement contributes to the meaning of each factor. A low loading on a factor means that the statement has little to do with that factor. A high number means that the statement does contribute to the interpretation of the factor. Variables highly correlated with one another will form a factor, and those that are not correlated will create separate factors.

The varimax rotation of the factor matrix increases our ability to interpret the data. In the principal components factor analysis process, most statements load most highly on the first factor, and each next factor has fewer and fewer items associated with it. Because this top-heavy distribution can be difficult to interpret, a process called factor rotation is utilized. This redistributes the factors, so that loadings are either very high or very low, eliminating the loadings in the middle.

The varimax rotation is one of many rotation options and uses a mathematical process to redefine the factors. This process helps separate each factor from one another and make each more distinct. These redistributed loadings are used to interpret the data. Though each researcher must use personal judgment regarding what makes a high
loading, loadings of .3, .4, and .5 are often used as minimums for an item to be meaningful in a particular factor category (Katchigan, 1986). Often, after a factor analysis and rotation is performed, items with low loadings or items that load the same on every factor are removed from the data. The entire analysis process is often repeated several times, each time removing data deemed not to be meaningful on any factor. In this manner, the data are reduced and simplified so that the final solution contains the most concise data with as little redundancy as possible.

In order to interpret the data garnered from the pilot MMS, five analyses were performed. Each analysis allowed for further clarity in interpretation and moved closer to the final solution. In each analysis, items and/or factors which did not fit the specified criteria (outlined below) were eliminated. The fifth analysis provided the most parsimonious interpretation and therefore was retained as the final solution.

In the first analysis, the 105 survey items were analyzed using principal components factor analysis. The solution revealed one general factor encompassing almost all of the survey items, and seven other more specific factors identified by a fewer number of items. Due to the small number of subjects in the pilot study (N = 96) and because many items were ambiguous and showed equal loadings across two or more factors, the varimax rotation was unable to be performed. Instead, using the each item’s factor loadings for each category, statements were identified by the researcher that had either no high loadings on any factor or items that loaded highly only on the first general factor and no other. These statements were eliminated. The eighth factor was also eliminated in the first analysis, as it showed only two items which loaded highly.
For the second analysis, a seven-factor solution was requested (after elimination of the 8th factor), and performed on the remaining statements. Again the varimax rotation was unable to be performed. As in the first analysis, statements were sought for elimination that loaded highly only on the first general factor, as well as those which loaded no higher than .40 on any factor. These items were eliminated. Two additional factors were also eliminated because they had only one or zero items that loaded with a .40 or higher.

In the third analysis, a five-factor solution was requested for the 75 statements that remained after the second analysis. In this analysis, the varimax rotation was successful, increasing our ability to interpret the results. Using the rotated matrix, additional items were eliminated. The items marked for elimination lacked a relatively independent “signature loading” (loading markedly higher on one factor with low loadings on all other factors). Items were eliminated using these criteria: items with low loadings on all factors (below .50) were eliminated; items which loaded .40 and higher on two or more factors were eliminated. Only items with high signature loadings were retained.

In the fourth analysis, 48 items remained. When the principal components analysis and varimax rotation were performed, the five factors were explored to further eliminate any troublesome items. The first factor still showed predominantly high loadings in many items. Therefore, items in Factor 1 not showing a signature loading in factor 1 of .60 or higher were eliminated. In Factors 2 and 3, many items also loaded highly so again items without a signature loading of .60 were eliminated. For
Factors 4 and 5, fewer items loaded highly so only items without a signature loading of .50 were eliminated. Before performing the fifth and final analysis, I returned to previous analyses and returned three items with reasonable signature loadings on Factors 4 and 5, as these factors showed a much lower number of items than did the other three factors. It was my intention to retain equal numbers of items from each factor, if possible.

After the fifth principal components analysis and varimax rotation was performed on the 40 remaining items, 38 items were retained that featured signature loadings of .50 and above. The final factor rotation matrix can be found in Appendix H. Five factor categories were also retained. In order to arrive at 50 statements for the MMS (10 for each factor) a short qualitative process was performed to add additional statements to factors 2, 3, 4, and 5.

Each factor’s items were qualitatively analyzed to identify the overall theme of the factor. For example, statements in Factor 1 all appeared to describe psychological benefits, such as gaining self-esteem, confidence, and receiving encouragement. To assist with the interpretation and organization of the factors and items within each factor, each factor was given a name descriptive of its overriding theme. These names were for ease of interpretation and organization only, and were qualitative in nature. They did not represent the only interpretation of the factors or items within the factors.

Factor 1, Psychological: Statements which loaded highly in this factor relate to students’ sense of self, personality, identity, and their emotional development. Statements in this category include “To share my talent with others,” “To bring meaning to life,” “To feel good about myself,” and “To be good at something.”

Factor 2, Future Music Goals: The statements which loaded highly in this
category describe future outcomes of learning about music. Statements in this category include “To be able to play an instrument in the future,” “To play in a band someday,” “To get a career in music,” and “To be a musician someday.”

Factor 3, Academic - Musical: Statements loading highly in this category also refer to music as a school subject, but center around the academic aspects of music class such as reading music and learning about composers, musical styles, and music history. Statements in this category include “To learn to read notes,” “To learn beats and rhythms,” “To learn how notes work and sound,” and “To learn about composers.”

Factor 4, Performing/Music Making: Statements loading highly in this category refer to playing music for others or performing. Statements in this category include “To sing,” “To entertain people,” “To perform in a concert,” and “To share my talent with others.”

Factor 5, Integrative (Social): Statements involving social interactions between individual students and groups of students loaded highly in this category. Statements in this category include “To talk to others,” “To make music with friends,” “To do group work,” and “To be with friends.”

Because not all factors had 10 statements at the conclusion of Analysis 5, a qualitative analysis and naming process was used to write additional statements for factors 2, 3, 4, and 5. Statements were written that appeared to be similar to the other statements with a signature loading on that factor, and appeared to measure the same basic construct. The list of the statements in each factor category appears in Appendix I; additions to each factor are indicated. Some statements were altered before being included in the final MMS. Items that were ambiguous were altered to improve their clarity, and compound statements were simplified. These statements are presented in below, in their original form from the pilot MMS and in their altered form seen on the
final MMS.

**Pilot Statement 4:**

Original: To be with friends or classmates

Altered: To be with friends

To be with classmates

**Pilot Statement 22:**

Original: To sing or play in a group

Altered: To sing or play in a group someday

**Pilot Statement 47:**

Original: To work with partners or a group

Altered: To work with partners

To do group work

The analyses performed on the pilot MMS data do merit a word of caution. Because the five factor categories and representative statements were developed in analyses using a small number of subjects (N = 96) and because the data reduction process occurred over several analyses, the pilot results may or may not be generalizable to the larger population seen in the final MMS data. However, clearly identifiable factors are seen in this pilot data, and the researcher believes that given the clarity of the five factors, the factors in the pilot should approximate those seen in the final MMS data.
Creation of the final Music Meaning Survey

The factor analysis confirmed the existence of five factor categories: Psychological, Future Music Goals, Academic-Musical, Performing/Music Making and Integrative (social). Statements that loaded highly in each category were retained and the others were eliminated. In some categories, new statements similar to the retained statements were created, so that each category featured ten statements. A total of 50 statements of meaning were used for the final version of the Music Meaning Survey. The 50 statements were arranged in a random order and given a four-point Likert-type rating scale (1 = really disagree, 2= sort of disagree, 3 = sort of agree, 4= really agree). The final version of the Music Meaning Survey used in the main study can be found in Appendix J.

The Main Study: Procedures

This section describes the procedures used in the study, including the selection of the sample, the administration of the instrument, and analysis of the data.

The Sample:

Data for the main study were gathered in the spring of 2005. Participants were students (N = 762) from 9 middle schools, whose music teachers volunteered to participate in the study. The middle schools, located in Maine, Minnesota, Indiana, Idaho, North Carolina, New Mexico, Arizona, and Hawaii represented the six MENC districts:

- Eastern: (CT, DC, MD, NH, NY, RI, DE, EU, ME, MA, NJ, PA, VT)
- North Central: (IL, IN, MN, NK, SD, IA, MI, NE, OH, WI)
- Northwest: (AK, ID, MT, OR, WA, WY)
- Southern: (AL, GA, LA, NC, TN, WV, FL, KY, MS, SC, VA)
- Southwestern: (AR, KS, NM, TX, CO, MO, OK)
- Western: (AZ, CA, HI, NV, UT)
Administration of the MMS:

The MMS was printed in a paper format and also converted into HTML text, for use in a web-based format. The web-based survey was posted at: www.musiceducationsurveys.com/virginia. The online survey was kept as identical as possible to the paper-and-pencil survey, featuring the same statements in the same order, and the same Likert-type rating scale. Both surveys featured these instructions:

Each of the short statements below describe what you might VALUE or FIND IMPORTANT or ENJOY about Music Class. For each statement, please circle HOW MUCH this describes how you feel about your music class:

Really Agree, Sort of Agree, Sort of Disagree, or Really Disagree.

Please think about each response. We want to find out what Music Class means for YOU. There are no right or wrong answers. Please answer honestly, we want to know how you really feel (not what you think someone else would want you to say).

Thank you for your help!

Participating teachers who preferred the online version administered the survey to their classes in their school computer labs and student responses were sent electronically to the researcher in a database at the University of Arizona. Instructions for using the online MMS can be found on Appendix K. Paper surveys were mailed to participating teachers, administered to the students, and then mailed back to the researcher. Of the 9 participating teachers, four elected to use the paper-and-pencil surveys, while 5 used the online format.

Analysis

Data from the final administration of the Meaning Survey were factor analyzed using principal components analysis with a varimax rotation. The analysis allowed the
MMS statements to be grouped together with similar statements into factor categories. The purpose of the analysis was to determine what dimensions of meaningfulness could be found in the school music experiences of the subjects. Using the factor categories, the students’ perspectives can be understood in broad terms. For example, one could say that students find music class meaningful for social reasons, musical reasons, and academic reasons.

Internal Validity

Content validity of the MMS is supported by the use of the open-ended questions in the instrument creating phase, presented to a sample of students similar to those in the final study. Doby (1967) indicates that before constructing appropriate survey questions, the researcher must engage in “unstructured interviewing around the major variables the questionnaire is intended to measure” (p. 254). In this way, states Doby, the researcher has the opportunity to know how subjects, similar to the final sample, feel about the problem under investigation (1967). The “universe of content to be analyzed” (Hylton, 1980, p. 63) must be defined. The students’ writing, which garnered a wide variety of opinions regarding the meaningfulness of the music education, helped ensure that the statements in the MMS were a valid measure of the myriad student perspectives on music education.
Construct validity of the survey is enhanced through the factor analysis process, which ensures that survey items are directly related to the category they represent. The relationships of the survey statements to each of the meaning categories were revealed by use of the principal components analysis and varimax rotation. Because all ambiguous statements or those without a clear relationship to a single category were eliminated, the remaining items show a higher validity.

Summary

The purpose of this study was to gather the perspectives of middle school students, in general music classrooms, about the meaningfulness of their musical education. An instrument, the MMS, was developed using ideas gathered directly from students during the instrument creation phase, to assess what the meaning of music education was to middle school students in general music classes. Before beginning the main study, a pilot MMS was administered to a small group of subjects. This pilot phase was used to gather quantitative data, establishing 5 factor categories with 10 statements per category, for a total of 50 statements of meaning. These statements were assorted in a random order in the final MMS, and given a four-point Likert-type rating scale. During the spring of 2005, the final MMS was administered to participants in schools from the six MENC districts, in order to gain representative views from students all across the country. Copies of the consent forms can be found in Appendix L. Analysis of the MMS data appears in Chapter 4.
CHAPTER 4
RESULTS

The purpose of this study was to explore the meaning of music education as perceived by middle school students in general music courses, and to determine what, if any, underlying dimensionality existed in this meaning, using factor-analytic techniques. In part one of the study, statements were generated using student responses to an open-ended question. These responses were used to create a survey instrument, the Music Meaning Survey (MMS). In part two of the study, the MMS was pilot-tested. The results of the pilot study were factor-analyzed, and 5 factor categories were obtained: Psychological, Future Music Goals, Academic-Musical, Performing/Music Making, and Integrative (social). The final MMS was created using 10 statements for each of the 5 factor categories, for a total of 50 statements. The final MMS was administered to middle school students (N = 762) in general music classes. In this chapter is a detailed description of the results, including descriptive data pertaining to the results of the Music Meaning Survey, the revealed dimensionality in the data, and an discussion of each of the factors.

Description of the Factor Analysis process of the Music Meaning Survey:

The results of the MMS were factor analyzed using principal components analysis and a varimax rotation. The factor analysis process is designed to group similar items together, for the purpose of determining what categories, or factors, exist within the data. The factor analysis generated a 5-factor solution and the varimax rotation was performed successfully. After the rotation, four of the factors appeared viable, with 8 to 10 items featuring signature loadings of .5 or higher. Factor 5 had no statements with high
signature loadings. This could be interpreted as indicating that factor 5 should be
eliminated. The rotated factor matrix is presented in Table 1. In Table 1, the highest
loading for each statement is shown, indicating the factor in which it is associated.
Because factor 5 had no statements associated primarily with it, it is not included in Table
1.

Table 1
Rotated Factor Matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.445</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>.392</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>.565</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.497</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>.637</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>.474</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.594</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td>.718</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>.529</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.789</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.727</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>.756</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.785</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.785</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.556</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 1, continued
Rotated Factor Matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.602</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
<td>.765</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>.523</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.626</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>.694</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>.401</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.697</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.568</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>.828</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td></td>
<td>.747</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.519</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.458</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>.832</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.675</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>.518</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.804</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.683</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.697</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>.788</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.694</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.627</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.708</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 1, continued

Rotated Factor Matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>.553</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td></td>
<td>.521</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>.848</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td></td>
<td>.717</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.705</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.753</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>.565</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.595</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>.635</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.811</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>.516</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.666</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>.525</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Two other measures were used to determine whether the fifth factor should be eliminated. The scree plot was consulted, which appeared to show four strong factors and a sharp drop-off after that. The scree plot can be found in Figure 1. The second measure consulted was the percent of variance for the rotated matrix. The percent of variance shows how much of the final solution is accounted for by each factor. Factors 1-4 showed a percent of variance between 11% and 18%. By comparison, the percent of variance for
factor 5 was 3.4%. The percent of variance for the analysis can be found in Table 2. Therefore, after viewing the rotated factor matrix, the scree plot, and the percent of variance, factor 5 was not interpreted.
Table 2

Percent of Variance in rotated factor structure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>% of Variance</th>
<th>Cumulative %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>18.178</td>
<td>18.178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>15.999</td>
<td>34.177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>12.074</td>
<td>46.251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>11.950</td>
<td>58.200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.412</td>
<td>61.612</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To interpret the data in the four viable factors, several procedures were followed. First, items were highlighted that featured the highest signature loadings. Items with signature loadings at least as high as .4 were retained. Second, the top six items in each factor, or six items with the highest signature loadings, were selected. The purpose of this was to further reduce the data, eliminate redundancy, and obtain the most parsimonious solution. In addition, by selecting only 6 items for each of 4 factors, future versions of the MMS could be shortened and inherent redundancy eliminated. The four factors, with their 6 signature items, are presented next.
Description of each factor

Factor 1: Vocational goals

Factor 1 could be interpreted as vocational goals such as becoming a musician or working in the music industry. It compares to Factor 2 “Future goals” of the pilot study. The statements that loaded highly in this category pertained to future outcomes of learning about music, including career and performance goals. The six items used to interpret factor 1 were statements 5, 12, 20, 24, 28, and 34. In the rotated factor matrix, statement 40 (“To have a career in the music industry”) also loaded highly in factor 1, but was eliminated because the wording was very close to that of statement 24 (“To get a job in the music business”). As in other parts of the data analysis, redundancy was eliminated whenever possible. The six items chosen for this factor are presented in Table 3, with their signature loadings.

Table 3
Factor 1, Vocational: statements and signature loadings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Loading</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5. To be a singer as an adult</td>
<td>.637.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. To sing or play in a group someday</td>
<td>.756</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. To perform in a concert</td>
<td>.694</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24. To get a job in the music business</td>
<td>.828</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28. To get a career in music</td>
<td>.832</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34. To be a musician someday</td>
<td>.788</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Factor 2: Academic

Factor 2 could be interpreted as pertaining to academic goals of music class, such as music theory and music history outcomes. This factor appeared similar to factor 3 "Academic/Musical" of the pilot study. Statements loading highly in this category referred to music as a school subject and centered around the academic aspects of music class such as reading music and learning about composers, musical styles, and music history. The six items used to interpret factor 2 were statements 8, 13, 14, 17, 25, and 43. Statement 41 ("To learn about composers’ lives") also loaded highly on Factor 4, but was removed to eliminate redundancy with statement 25 ("To learn about composers"). The six items describing factor 2 are presented in Table 4, with their factor loadings.

Table 4
Factor 2, Academic: statements and signature loadings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Loading</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8. To learn about different kinds of music</td>
<td>.718</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. To know about the history of music</td>
<td>.785</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. To learn beats and rhythms</td>
<td>.765</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. To learn to read notes</td>
<td>.765</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25. To learn about composers</td>
<td>.747</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43. To learn how notes work and sound</td>
<td>.753</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Factor 3: Belongingness

Statements in factor 3 relate to social aspects of music class, such as talking with friends and doing group work. This factor compares to factor 5 of the pilot study, “Integrative (social).” Statements loading highly in this category involved social interactions between individual students and groups of students. The six statements used to interpret factor 3 were statement 10, 31, 33, 37, 42, and 47. These six items with their factor loadings are presented in Table 5.

Table 5:

Factor 3, Belongingness: statements and signature loadings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement:</th>
<th>Loading:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10. To talk to others</td>
<td>.789</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31. To get together with friends</td>
<td>.804</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33. To enjoy being with classmates</td>
<td>.697</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37. To work with partners</td>
<td>.708</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42. To socialize</td>
<td>.705</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47. To be with friends</td>
<td>.811</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Factor 4: Agency

Factor 4 pertains to psychological benefits derived from music class. Factor 4 is similar to factor 1 of the pilot study, “Psychological.” Statements that loaded highly in this factor related to students’ sense of self-esteem, motivation, identity, and emotional development. The six top-loading statements in factor 4 were statement 19, 22, 29, 32, 36, and 45. These statements and their factor loadings are presented in Table 6.

Table 6:
Factor 4, Agency: statements and signature loadings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Loading</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>19. To set goals</td>
<td>.626</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. To feel good about myself</td>
<td>.697</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29. To bring meaning to life</td>
<td>.675</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32. To get self-confidence</td>
<td>.683</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36. To get encouragement</td>
<td>.627</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45. To get things off my chest</td>
<td>.595</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reliability of the four factors

Reliabilities for each 6-item factor category were calculated using Cronbach’s Alpha formula (Cronbach, 1951). The reliability measure is used to determine the replicability of the four factors. A high reliability coefficient is an indication that if the
MMS were administered again to a similar sample, the same four factors would be likely to appear. The reliability coefficients are presented in Table 7.

Table 7:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Reliability Coefficient</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Factor 1: Vocational</td>
<td>.907</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Factor 2: Academic</td>
<td>.900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Factor 3: Belongingness</td>
<td>.879</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Factor 4: Psychological</td>
<td>.890</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In order to further confirm the replicability of the results of the MMS, two Cronbach’s Alpha reliability tests were performed separately using only the odd numbered subjects (n = 381), and only the even numbered subjects (n = 382). The results of these two analyses can be compared to each other and to the reliabilities of the complete sample. The results of the reliability measures for the odd- and even-numbered sample are found in Table 8.
Table 8:
Reliability Coefficients for each factor category

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Reliability Coefficient</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Odd numbered subjects (n = 381)</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Factor 1: Vocational</td>
<td>.912</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Factor 2: Academic</td>
<td>.894</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Factor 3: Belongingness</td>
<td>.871</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Factor 4: Psychological</td>
<td>.900</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| **Even numbered subjects (n = 382)** |                         |
| Factor 1: Vocational interests/future goals | .904                     |
| Factor 2: Academic              | .906                    |
| Factor 3: Belongingness         | .886                    |
| Factor 4: Psychological         | .891                    |

Intercorrelations Among the Factors:

In the principal components analysis and varimax rotation, four clear factor categories are shown. Through the reduction of ambiguous data, it is possible to show the four factor categories as being as independent of each other as possible. However, because all four factors may also relate to one global construct (such as attitude toward
There is some intercorrelation between the factors. These intercorrelations are presented in Table 9.

Table 9
Intercorrelations between factors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>F1</th>
<th>F2</th>
<th>F3</th>
<th>F4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>F1</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>.525</td>
<td>.241</td>
<td>.528</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F2</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>.126</td>
<td>.467</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>.627</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Correlations between the factors range from .126 to .627. All of the factors are positively related, which may indicate that all 4 factors relate to one construct. Vocational factor (factor 1) correlates most highly (.53) with the Psychological factor (factor 4) but also correlates closely (.52) with the Academic (factor 2). The Academic factor (factor 2) correlates most highly (.53) with the Vocational factor (factor 1). The Belongingness factor (factor 3) shows the highest correlation (.63) with the Psychological factor (factor 4). The Psychological factor (factor 4) correlates most highly (.63) with the Belongingness factor (factor 3). One might say that factors 1 and 2 (Vocational and Academic) tend to correlate with each other, and factors 3 and 4 (Psychological and Belongingness) tend to correlate with each other.
Summary

To determine underlying dimensionality in the MMS data, a principal components analysis and a varimax rotation was performed. In this analysis process, similar statements were grouped into factor categories and ambiguous statements to be eliminated. Four interpretable factors were extracted. These factors were qualitatively labeled Vocational interests/Future goals, Academic, Belongingness, and Psychological. Therefore it can be said that the music education experience of middle school general music students appears to by multi-faceted, or show dimensionality. Although the four factors were relatively independent of each other, they also showed some positive intercorrelations with each other. This can be interpreted to indicate that the 4 factors all related to a generic construct of musical meaning. These results are discussed and interpreted in more detail in Chapter 5.
CHAPTER 5
CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Though music has been a part of education for centuries, its purpose, function, and meaning have not always been clear. Scholars, philosophers, and educators have debated music education’s place in schools, ranging from functional purposes such as increasing self-discipline, to goals such as aesthetic response.

Scholarly thought in the area of meaning in education, and in music education in particular has encouraged research in the area of attitudes and perspectives on music education. Researchers have found that grade level was a significant predictor of attitude toward music class, particularly between the third and the sixth grades (Nolin, 1973). Other researchers have found that students’ views of music class varied according to what activities were used in class. In general, students tended to prefer active music making such as playing instruments and singing, rather than studying music theory, for example (Nolin, 1973). Other researchers have found that participation in music had multifaceted outcomes, such as achievement outcomes, psychological aspects, and communicative aspects (Hylton, 1980). Additional research pertaining to student perspectives on music class may provide insight into student outcomes not previously assessed. Though much research and scholarly thought exists about what students might gain from a musical education, little research exists in which student perceptions of music education’s meaning, or importance, has been explored.
Therefore, the purpose of the present study was to investigate the meaning of music education as perceived by middle school students in general music classrooms. Specifically, this study addresses the following questions:

1. What meaning do middle school general music students derive from music education?

2. Can underlying categories, or dimensions, be educed from students’ perceptions of meaning? If these dimensions do exist, what are they and what relationships exist among them?

Discussion

In order to investigate the issue of music education’s meaningfulness as perceived by middle school students, an essential assessment tool was devised in which students were asked to respond to 50 statements pertaining to aspects of music class which might be meaningful. According to the MMS, subjects did ascribe particular meaning to music education. In particular, it was found that the meaning students derived from their music education experience could be assimilated into four categories: Vocational, Academic, Belongingness, and Psychological. A short summary of each factor category appears below.

Vocational: The statements that loaded highly in this category described career-oriented outcomes for learning about music. The top six representative statements were: “To be a singer as an adult,” “To sing or play in a group someday,” “To perform in a concert,” “To get a job in the music business,” “To get a career in music,” and “To be a
musician someday.”

Academic: The statements that loaded highly in this category referred to the academic aspects of music class such as reading music, learning about composers, and musical styles. The top six representative statements were: “To learn about different kinds of music,” “To know about the history of music,” “To learn beats and rhythms,” “To learn to read notes,” “To learn about composers,” and “To learn how notes work and sound.”

Belongingness: Statements involving social interactions between individual students and groups of students loaded highly in this category. The top six representative statements in this category were: “To talk to others,” “To get together with friends,” “To enjoy being with classmates,” “To work with partners,” “To socialize,” and “To be with friends.”

Agency: The statements that loaded highly in this factor related to students’ self-esteem, motivation, and emotional development. The top six representative statements in this category included: “To set goals,” “To feel good about myself,” “To bring meaning to life,” “To get self-confidence,” “To get encouragement,” and “To get things off my chest.”

As was shown in Table 2, the four factors retained after the factor rotation and analysis all showed strong contributions to the percent of variance. The four categories combined contributed 58% to the total understanding of the overall meaning construct. The meaningfulness of each factor to middle school students is as unique as the statistical significance of these items. A discussion of each dimension of meaning appears next.
Discussion of the Factors:

Vocational

The Vocational category, as the strongest contributor to the percent of variance (18%), may be the most meaningful factor to students. As part of the Vocational factor, students expressed an interest in being performers with statements such as: “To sing or play in a group someday,” “To perform in a concert,” and “To be a singer as an adult.” The idea being conveyed may be that students want to be actively engaged in music. The finding that students have an expressed interest in performance supports previous findings by Nolin (1973), among others. Nolin (1973) found that students rated playing instruments highly, as well as playing rhythm games and dancing, preferring these activities to more passive ones such as learning about composers. The popularity of reality television programs such as “American Idol,” in which ordinary people compete for the chance to become a pop star, invite music participation. As young adolescents become increasingly interested in popular music through these or other means, many may dream of becoming a rock star and performing on stage. They may see the experiences they gain in music class as relating to that aspiration.

According to David Elliott (1995) active music making (“musicing”) is at the heart of music education. Elliott believes that musicianship can be attained only through active music making. In school music programs, it is important that music making take place through authentic music activities mindfully designed by music educators to provide age- and ability-appropriate musical experiences. Musicianship develops as
students meet musical challenges of increasing difficulty. Musical performances provide an opportunity for students to demonstrate musical competence and understanding. Opportunities for active music making and performing give students an outlet for stress and a means for self-expression.

Musical performing may not be the only vocational goal held by students. As Hargreaves and North (1999) explain, what is meant by the word “musicianship” is changing in the face of new technology. Students now have more job opportunities in music than just “performer” or “teacher.” These technological advances are creating careers in the music industry. Middle school students may see jobs like sound engineer, producer, or recording technician as a way to combine a love of music with a possibly lucrative career. In addition, digital technology like MIDI has become increasingly common; powerful software for the home computer allows users to compose, arrange, mix, produce and distribute music in the comfort of their own homes (Hargreaves & North, 1999). Students increasingly have access to this type of technology, which may make “a career in the music business” a desirable and even realistic aspiration for many students.

Academic

The second highest contributor to the percent of variance (15.9%) was the Academic factor. In general music classes, many students who completed the MMS indicated an interest in the academic side of music. Learning how to read music, learning about composers, and learning about different styles of music were all strong contributors to the Academic factor category. As middle school students move from concrete
operations into formal operations, often fluctuating between the two (Piaget & Inhelder, 1973), academic expectations placed upon these students increase. Middle school students want to do well in school (Irvin, 1997). As students become more aware of cognitive or academic outcomes in their school courses, it would follow that an academic emphasis would also be evident in courses such as general music.

During the instrument-creation phase students often indicated in their writing that the purpose of learning to read music and understanding musical notes and rhythms was related to learning to play an instrument. Although these students were not participating in a school performing ensemble, many students may have been learning to play an instrument such as piano. It remains quite common for students to take private instrumental or vocal lessons, sing in church choirs, or play in a “garage band” or other type of musical group. Participation in many of these activities requires the ability to read music. Other students believed the value of learning to read music related to the possibility of learning to play an instrument in the future. In fact, many students indicated that learning to read music was helpful “just in case you ever need to.” These students felt that they could become interested in learning to play an instrument as an adult and saw learning music theory and history as relating to this endeavor.

Middle school students are becoming more interested in popular music styles, often forming “taste cultures” in which members of a social group share a similar interest in a particular style of music and its associated clothing, hair styles, and the like (Zillmann & Gan, 1997). Hargreaves and North (1999) noted that because music consumption has become increasingly mobile (through the use of portable CD players
and MP3 players), and because an infinite variety of musical styles is readily available on
the Internet, middle school students may have an increasing desire to discover what
musical genres they might enjoy listening to. In music class, statements such as “To learn
about different kinds of music,” might be explained by this interest in studying or
comparing musical styles.

Belongingness

The third highest contribution to the percent of variance was from the Belongingness factor. Early adolescence is a time of many changes: biological, social, and cognitive (Eccles & Wigfield, 1997). As students make the transition from
elementary school to the middle grades, issues of social involvement and peer acceptance
become very important. According to middle-grades researchers, early adolescence is
marked by a strong need for attachment, particularly to a valued group (Eccles &
Wigfield, 1997). Music lends itself to social functions quite naturally. Music is an
integral part of social ceremonies such as weddings, funerals, parties, church services,
and the like (Crozier, 1997). Merriam mentioned the social functions of music making,
such as “Validation of social institutions and religious rituals.” Gaston, too, mentioned
social outcomes in his eight fundamental considerations of the musical experience,
including “The potency of music is greatest in the group.” Making music in a group
setting continues to be a powerful force for many people; music can be an effective way
of creating a sense of belonging (Gregory, 1997). Consequently, opportunities to affiliate
with peers in the music classroom are an important part of creating a supportive learning
environment for middle school students. Subjects in this study indicated a desire for
social interaction in the classroom, rating activities like group and partner work highly. More than just the opportunity for off-task socialization, peer interaction in the classroom can help facilitate students’ cooperative abilities. Researchers have indicated that social interaction in the classroom may enhance students’ motivation, state Jackson & Davis (2000). When they belong to a group of supportive adults and peers, these social interactions appear to stimulate achievement (Jackson & Davis, 2000).

Agency

The fourth highest contributor to the percent of variance was the Agency factor. For adolescents, the rapid changes they experience may contribute to a decrease in self-esteem (Jackson & Davis, 2000). Some researchers believe that social comparisons among teens, as well as concerns of competence, romantic appeal, and close friendships affect adolescents’ sense of self-esteem (Irvin, 1997). Schools and teachers can help students through this tumultuous transition period by promoting students’ academic and personal self-worth. Approaches such as cooperative learning and curricula allowing students to take more control of their school lives, service learning for example, can be valuable. Experiences in music class appear to have psychological benefits that may help students increase feelings of self-worth and competence.

Subjects who completed the MMS found music class to be psychologically meaningful. Music-making provided psychological benefits such as enhancing self-confidence, getting encouragement, feeling good about themselves, and “getting things off (their) chest(s).” In addition to these psychological benefits, the nature of music making may provide a means of stress-relief. In the instrument-creation phase some
students indicated that for them, music class provided a way to relax. Opportunities to make music may be a much-needed respite from the daily life of many middle school students; days filled with competition, social comparison, and academic achievement goals.

Aesthetic or Utilitarian?

In Chapter 1, two different views were expressed concerning the purpose of music education. One view, the aesthetic philosophy, was related to teaching music in order to teach aesthetic sensitivity and affective response to music, and help students appreciate musical or artistic beauty. The other view pertained to functional outcomes of music education, such as improving reading or mathematical skills, and gaining personal qualities such as self-discipline. Are either of these philosophies supported by the findings of this study?

Of the aesthetic view, students found listening to music and performing music to be meaningful. They appreciated learning about different musical styles, about composers, and wanted to learn “how notes work and sound.” According to Kneiter (1971), in an aesthetic experience a person focuses on a stimulus, experiences thoughts and feelings, and then evaluates the occurrence based upon previous experiences. In this study, students indicated that the act of participating in music helped them “get things off (their) chest.” That music making was a means for students to express their thoughts and feelings may point to the result of an aesthetic experience. The statement 29, “To bring meaning to life,” in the Psychological factor also appears strongly related to an aesthetic outcome of music education. Students found that music making and musical learning was
an integral part of their lives. As the Tanglewood Declaration stated, music and the other arts are related to a person’s search for “identity and self-realization” (Choate, 1968, p. 139), and statement 29 appears to be a reflection of this.

The utilitarian view of music education can be seen in student responses, particularly those pertaining to vocational training. The Vocational factor may be most strongly associated with the utilitarian view. Students found music class meaningful because they perceived it as preparing them for a future career. To these students music class was valuable for what it could do for them: provide knowledge relating to future career goals. For the students, statements like “To get a job in the music business,” and “To be a singer as an adult,” appear related to a belief that music class was meaningful because of the potential for acquisition of skills necessary for certain jobs.

Additional support for the utilitarian view can be seen in parts of the Psychological factor. Proponents of the utilitarian philosophy often spoke of musical training as a way to improve character, increase self-discipline, and “humanize” people (Birge, 1966). The students who took part in the MMS appeared to believe this philosophy as well. These students cited music class as a way to set goals, get self-confidence, and feel good about themselves, which all relate to “humanizing” effects.

The Belongingness factor may also be seen as relating to the utilitarian view. According to the students in the present study, music class was meaningful to them partly because it offered an opportunity for social interaction. Previous researchers and educators have indicated a social purpose for music education. Cutietta, Hamann and Walker (1995) found that musical training could increase self-esteem and the quality of
social interactions. Lowell Mason believed that music could “socialize” human beings (Birge, 1966). The value of the socializing effects of music can be seen in the results of the MMS. Students valued the social outcomes of music education, such as the opportunity to work with partners and to be with friends.

That the meaningfulness of music education can be represented by categories of meaning, representing both aesthetic and utilitarian outcomes, indicates that participation in music may be a multi-faceted experience for students. The results of the MMS may be interpreted as supporting no single outcome of music education; rather, students derive multiple benefits from education in music, represented by the four factor categories. These results are counter to a position or curriculum where one specific outcome is stressed at the detriment of others. For instance, a music course in which music theory and history is emphasized at the expense of other outcomes may deprive students of the equally meaningful benefits related to the other factor categories. Because students differ in their perspectives, goals, and desires, and because music education can be meaningful in a variety of ways, no single outcome of music education should be emphasized at the expense of another.

Conclusions

The primary conclusion that can be drawn from this study is that for middle school students, music class can be a meaningful and multi-faceted experience. This is counter to a colloquial assumption that general music students hold a poor attitude toward music class and derive little value from the experience. Even though the subjects were not involved in musical ensembles or other formal school-based music participation, the
students nevertheless derived considerable meaning from their general music experiences. Four strong categories of meaning were determined from analysis of the MMS data, indicating strong agreement among the students regarding the importance of music education. For these students, the meaning of music education was represented by four primary dimensions: Vocational, Academic, Social, and Agency. Vocational outcomes were highly valued; students pointed to career goals of becoming a professional musician or working in the music industry. Many of the students appreciated the academic side of music education, such as learning to read music and studying music history. Music class benefited the students socially, giving them opportunities to connect with others and work collaboratively. Lastly, students felt their music classes helped them psychologically in terms of self-esteem, motivation, and self-expression.

Implications for future research

Through the administration of the MMS, it was found that middle school students enrolled in general music courses perceived four categories of meaning pertaining to music education. It would be interesting to determine whether students involved in other types of music courses also derive meaning from their experiences. Future research is needed to continue to explore the meaning of different kinds of musical experiences within different classes as well as different settings and populations. Do the categories of meaning determined by the MMS differ according to age or type of ensemble, or are some outcomes of music education universal? Hylton, (1980) in his investigation of the meaning of the high school choral experience, found seven categories of meaning,
including the four factors found by the MMS. Future studies could help us determine what outcomes may be common to all types of music participation.

One group of possible studies could focus on students of varying age, particularly in light of the finding that attitudes toward music class may be related to students’ grade level (Vander Ark, Nolin, & Newman, 1980, Mizener, 1993, Philips & Aichison, 1998). The MMS explored the value of music for middle school students, but this may differ for older or younger students. For example, what meaning do high school students derive from music education opportunities that may differ from the perceptions of the middle school students in this study? Does the meaning of music education differ for college students as opposed to secondary-school students? The perspectives of college students could also be investigated to determine the meaning of music education as perceived by music majors, or by non-majors. Finally, research pertaining to meaning in music could also explore the perspectives of adults who participate in community ensembles, or adults who are participating in music groups for the first time, such as in the New Horizons adult bands.

Another group of studies could investigate the relationship between meaning and the type of ensemble in which the student participates. Hylton (1980) shed light on the meaning of the choral experience as perceived by high school choir participants, in his study conducted on this population. Do Hylton’s findings or the results of the MMS reflect the perspectives of students in other types of music classes? Middle school students who participate in choirs, bands, or orchestras could hold a different perspective on music education than do their counterparts in general music. Students participating in
ensembles may find greater meaning in performing activities than do the general music students surveyed in the MMS. Band or orchestra students might value additional outcomes not explored in studies involving choir or general music students.

A third group of studies might explored, in which the differences between formal ensemble participation and other types of music making were assessed. Do students who participate in formal musical experiences derive different meaning from music than those students who participate in more informal groups, such as garage bands? Students who choose informal means of music making may hold vastly different perspectives from students who participate in music activities within a school setting. Might these students value academic outcomes less, focusing more on social or psychological factors? In addition, students who participate in music via private lessons, such as pianists, could be compared to students who are involved with group music making. For example, solo performers may not value social factors as highly, and may instead find meaning in an outcome not applicable to students in ensembles.

In addition to the descriptive and comparative studies outlined above, experimental studies could also be performed. The Music Meaning Survey may be used as a pretest and posttest, in order to measure whether participation in certain types of activities might increase the value of music education for students. In addition, external validity of the MMS could be confirmed by investigating the perspectives of late-middle or early high school students in combined choir/general music courses. By administering both the MMS and Hylton’s Choral Meaning (1980) survey to these students, validity of both surveys could be tested.
Other possibilities for future research include longitudinal studies in which researchers follow students through their music education classes and measure the meaningfulness of the experience as students progress through the grades. More research is also needed in the area of the affective domain, to further identify how music and other subjects may increase students’ affective abilities. Further research is needed with middle school students, a population that is still underrepresented in educational research (and specifically in music education research). Valuable research exists pertaining to elementary school students and high school students. By increasing research with middle school students, it may be possible to better understand the educational needs of all students as they progress through our school systems. For the same reasons, general music students should also be used more often as subjects. Using the MMS it was shown that general music students value music as a part of their education. Including middle-and high-school general music students in music education research may help educators continue to explore the perspectives of all students.

Implications for Music Education

One implication of the findings of the MMS is to increase support for general music programs in middle schools and high schools. The generalized music course is no longer found in many parts of the country, perhaps eliminated in favor of performing ensembles or a “back to basics” curriculum. However, even students who choose not to participate in performance groups can benefit from music education. If “music for every child” is truly the mantra of music educators, we must continue to support the myriad ways of musical learning. Music courses offer students an opportunity to grow
academically, socially, psychologically, and vocationally. Students find music class to be a meaningful part of their education. Music educators should continue reaching out to every child, and schools should continue offering a wide variety of music courses to meet students’ needs. This includes general music courses in secondary schools, as well as “alternative” music classes such as courses in electronic music, guitar classes, rock and jazz history, and specialty groups like steel drum bands, handbell choirs, gamelan ensembles, or mariachi groups. Public school music education should reflect the wide world of music making and give all students the opportunity to experience a true musical education, one that includes these vital vocational, academic, social, and agency outcomes.

The findings of this study may also be used to help increase support for music programs in schools and throughout communities. According to the results of the MMS, students who do not participate in school-sponsored musical ensembles nevertheless value performing, music theory and history, and appreciate the social and agency benefits of music education. As these middle school students grow into adulthood, they are likely to make decisions about whether to participate in music or support the arts in their communities. Today’s middle school students represent tomorrow’s voters, parents, and citizens whose attitudes towards music education may affect the future of school and community music programs. According to the Theory of Reasoned Action (Azjen & Fishbein, 1980), beliefs affect attitude, which affects behavior. If a student believes music is important, they are likely to hold a positive attitude toward it, and behave accordingly by participating in music or attending concerts. Therefore, music teachers could make
students aware of the myriad benefits they gain from participation in music, encourage students to think about what they value in music education, and help students find ways to act upon their values.

A third implication for educators is that meaningful experiences in school appear strongly related to students optimal functioning, well-being and happiness (Natvig, et al, 2003). Optimal well-being is associated with the prevention of illness and disease, as well as with healthy functioning in society. According to Natvig et al, who explored factors related to happiness among adolescents, “meaningful activities were significantly related to life satisfaction and well-being” (2003). In addition, factors such as self-efficacy both in academic and social situations, social support from teachers and peers, and a feeling that the content of work in school is valuable all contribute significantly to the well-being of adolescents (Natvig et al, 2003). These findings support the findings if the present study, in which students indicated similar aspects of what makes music class meaningful: challenging academic work, the opportunity to socialize, vocational relavance of the material, and psychological benefits such as self-esteem. For adolescents, music class appears to make a valuable contribution to happiness and well-being, by including those elements most related to that state of being. Music educators, as well as teachers in other school subjects, are encouraged to continue providing meaningful experiences in music for students which can contribute to a lifetime of well-being.
APPENDIX A:
TEACHER INSTRUCTION PAGE
FOR INSTRUMENT-CREATION PHASE
SURVEY
Hi!

Thanks for agreeing to hand out my survey, it is much appreciated! Hopefully this research will shed some light on the perspectives of students participating in middle school general music courses, allowing us to better serve these students.

Please read the following instructions carefully, in order to assure that the students understand what they are being asked to do.

1) Participation in this research is totally voluntary. Students can elect not to participate without any repercussions. Please suggest an alternate activity for students who choose not to participate, such as reading silently or working on other homework, etc. It’s important that students not be penalized for non-participation.

2) Please read the following statement to the students:

   “Today you are being asked to participate in a research project. We are trying to find out what students think of their educational experiences, especially in music classes. We know a lot about what teachers think is important about learning music, but we want to know what students think is actually valuable and WHY.

   “We appreciate your help in this project. If you decide you don’t want to fill out my survey, that’s ok. It’s totally voluntary, and you will not be penalized by anyone if you decide not to participate. If you do choose to help, you will not need to put your name on your paper, your teacher will not read your answers, and no one will know what you write. Please be honest! We want to know how you really feel, good and bad. Please write AS MUCH as you can, especially about WHY you think what you do.

   “Your teacher will read the instructions with you. Please feel free to ask your teacher if you have any questions. Thanks for your help— hopefully this will help us make music classes more valuable and useful for students.”
3) Please hand out the survey. Students should put only the name of the school and their grade level on the paper (this is just for organizational purposes). Please read the instructions at the top of the survey aloud. Please ASK if the students have any questions. Remind them the survey continues on the back of the page.

4) Please collect all the used and unused surveys and mail them in the return envelope. Feel free to email me if you have any questions!

😊 THANKS SO MUCH FOR YOUR HELP!!! 😊
APPENDIX B:

INSTRUMENT CREATION PHASE

SURVEY
Music Class Survey

School Name_______________________________  Grade _________

Thank you for sharing your experience with us! We hope that the information you give will help to make music classes even better for students like you!

Please take a minute to think about the time you have spent in school music classes. Please list your thoughts about what music class means to you. WHAT is important about music class, and WHY is it important to you?

WHAT:

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

WHY:

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________
WHAT:


WHY:


WHAT:


WHY:


THANK YOU!! 😊
APPENDIX C:

COMPLETE ORIGINAL STATEMENTS OF MEANING

FROM SUBJECTS IN

INSTRUMENT CREATION PHASE
School #1

1- to learn something you might use later in life

2- to learn something (reading music) that not everyone can do
to practice good posture

3- to learn breathing for singing
to play games that help you learn

4- to learn the ‘musician’s language’
to learn musical styles

5- teachers should give more effort
   students feel scared to ask questions
   it’s hard to learn so much info in a short amount of time

10- to learn songs
to learn to control your voice
to earn grades

11- to listen to music
to talk
School #2

1- music class helps me remember things
to enjoy music
to play the piano
because I like my teacher
to be challenged
to be with friends/classmates
to help others
to perform
to be happy
to overcome shyness
because the piano wants me to play it (driven to play, etc)

2- (spanish)

3- (spanish)

4- (spanish)

5- to learn how to read notes
to learn how to play the handbells

6- to learn how to read notes
reading music might be useful later in life
playing bells is cool
to play an instrument I had never played before

7- to learn to sing
some people might want to be singers as adults
for fun
to play different instruments

8- to play the instruments
to hear the sound of the instruments
because counting notes is easy
it’s something everyone can do

9- to use the instruments

10- to learn how to play notes
to learn to play handbells
(School #2)

11- music is useful later in life
    music can help you do things like homework, read, sleep
    to get a job in the music business
    to learn about all different kinds of music

12- to understand notes
    to play handbells
    to learn responsibility
    to learn rhythms
    to learn lots of things in a short time

13- to learn to read music
    to use later if you want to be a musician
    to learn to play instruments
    for fun

14- to learn to play handbells
    to learn to read notes

15- to learn to read notes
    to learn to count notes
    to use later in life to play an instrument
    to learn musical concepts
    to learn to write a song

16- to learn notes
    to learn to play instruments
    to be a music teacher in the future

17- to learn to play handbells
    for fun

18- to learn to play notes
    to read music to play instruments
    to perform in a concert
    for fun
to perform in front of others

19- to play instruments
   (School #2)

20- to learn to play handbells
    to learn about different kinds of music

21- to learn to play music
    to learn how to listen
    to learn where different music comes from
    to play instruments

22- to learn how to play instruments
    to learn to read notes
    to use in the future

23- to learn to count rhythms
    to learn new things
    to play handbells

24- to read musical notes
    to use in the future
    to play instruments
    to learn to play instruments correctly

25- to use instruments
    to read music

26- to learn how music originated
    to learn about all kinds of music
    to learn how to listen
    to learn about elements of music

27- to learn to play the piano
    to learn the notes for playing the piano
    to get encouragement from the teacher

28- to learn to play the piano
    to feel good about myself
    to learn notes

29- (Spanish)
30- to learn rhythms
    to learn about music
    to play instruments
(School #2)

31- to learn to play the piano
    to become a professional musician
    to learn new things
    to display talent
    to play for my parents
    to learn to perform
    to overcome shyness
    to learn notes

32- to experience new things
    to have fun

33- to learn to play an instrument
    to play for other people
    to learn to count rhythms

34- to learn to play the piano
    to have fun

35- to learn to play the piano
    to learn how to read music

36- to learn to play the piano
    to learn to count rhythms

37- to learn to play the piano

38- to spend time playing instruments
    to sing

39- to learn to play the piano
    to have something to practice
    to entertain people

40- (spanish)

41- to have fun
    to learn something new
to learn new songs
because the teachers are nice

42- to play the instruments
to learn more songs

School #3

1- to learn about composers
to learn to appreciate different music
to know the differences between artists
learn about past music to appreciate today’s music

2- to put on plays
to perform songs with motions
to participate with a group of people

3- to work with partners
to listen to music

4- for fun

5- to learn about people (composers?) that you didn’t know about before
because it is an easy credit
to learn how composers impact today’s music

6- to learn about different time periods
to learn about the background of modern day music
to learn about composers
to compare the music of different composers
to learn about music from other countries
to compare the music of the past to music of today

7- because it is important to have music in your life
because music helps form your personality
to discover different types of music
to sing
to have hands-on experience

8- to be challenged with difficult work
to “meet” different composers and learn about their lives
to listen to different kinds of music
to learn how composers felt when they wrote their music
9- nothing

(School #3)

11- to do group projects
to listen to music
to talk to friends
to work on your own projects
to go to the library
to do research on the computer

11- to learn music history
to sing
to use your voice to have a big effect on people
School #4

1- to learn how to sing well
   because music is part of life
   to dance
   because you hear music every day
   to participate in plays and talent shows
   because I like music
   to do a lot of different things

2- to learn how to read music
    to play instruments
    to watch movies

3- to learn to sing better
    to gain self-confidence
    for fun

4- to learn to sing
    to learn about music notes

5- to learn to sing
    to learn music notes
    to learn to write a song
    to learn to play instruments

6- to sing for other people
    to learn to not be scared to sing in front of others

7- to express myself
    to learn to read notes
    to play an instrument

8- to get a good grade
    to learn songs from different cultures
    to learn songs about different events
9- music brings meaning to life
for fun

10- music helps you in life
   to sing
   for the sound of the music

(School #4)

11- for fun
   to learn how notes work and sound

12- to learn to write music

13- to play instruments
   to write a song
   to play a song
   to make an instrument
   to earn a grade

14- to learn notes
   because it is easy
   to sing
   because it helps my life
   to talk to others
   to work out problems
   because I like my teacher

15- to learn notes
   because the teacher is nice

16- to learn notes
   to learn to write a song
   to learn about composers
   to sing
   to learn musical styles
   to learn what styles I like and don’t like
17- to learn to sing
to express my feelings
to learn from the teacher
to play instruments
to sing songs and “stretch our vocal chords”

(School #4)

18- to learn to sing
so you can sing in a choir when you’re older
to be okay at something
to play an instrument
to learn notes
to learn about other countries
to learn about past and present music

19- to learn notes
in case you want to play an instrument
to sing
to get things off your chest
to know about composers/history
to learn different musical styles
to play instruments
to make a rhythm

20- to learn notes
to play instruments better
to learn about important people in orchestras

21- to learn notes
to help learn to be a musician
to develop a good voice
to learn who some musicians are
to learn to sing/use your lungs

22- to get better at singing
to learn the notes on the piano

23- to learn notes
to set goals
to let your thoughts and feelings flow

24-  to learn chords  
     to understand music better  
     to learn about different styles of music

25-  to learn to read music  
     to sing different types of songs  
     to learn about different styles of music  
     to play instruments, drums

(School #4)

26-  to learn rhythm  
     to learn styles of music  
     to be able to identify the style of a song on the radio  
     to learn about composers

27-  to have a good teacher  
     to listen to music you like  
     because listening to the wrong kind of music will change who you are

28-  to show your feelings  
     for fun

29-  to cheer you up  
     to benefit your personal life and personality  
     to learn notes  
     to write a song  
     to make musical memories  
     to feel like you can do anything you want to do  
     to learn about past composers and how they affect music today  
     to learn more respect for music

30-  to learn about what types of music other people like  
     to learn how music affects your life  
     to learn how composers affect culture?

31-  to learn how music affects your life  
     to use what you’ve learned about music  
     to learn how music from different eras sounds different  
     to learn beats and rhythms

32-  to sing
because music brings joy to people
to relax others by singing to them
to dance to music
because music helps if you’re lonely or hurt

33- to learn notes
to help me play the guitar
to learn how important (music) is
to understand music

(School #4)

34- to experience different types of music
to learn how music affects your life
music expresses different emotions
to write songs of different styles

35- to learn about musical styles
to learn how music affects your life, good and bad
to learn that music is important
to learn how to play an instrument
for fun
to learn about composers
to learn something interesting and cool

36- learning different styles of music
to teach someone else about styles
to learn notes
to be a musician

37- because of the teachers

38- because my teacher is nice

39- to learn and get smarter
because the teacher is kind

40- to benefit our personal lives
to calm down, settle down
to help when you feel bad
to learn about different composers
41- because it is a sample of what music class will be like in later grades
   because music teaches every part of your brain
42- because listening to music is joyful

School #5

1. to play instruments of different types
   because it’s fun to learn different things
   to learn how to play any instrument
   because the teacher makes music fun
   to learn the history of music
   to help us when we are older

2. because it is fun
   to learn all types of music
   because without music people would be bored

3. to realize how much music is in your life

4. to learn about different musicians
   to learn how musicians came to the music business
   to learn about musicians from the past
   to pass the class

5. to sing
   to sing in a group

6. to get a good grade

7. to learn about instruments
   to entertain through music
   to sing
   because of the teaching

8. to train my voice
to expand my knowledge about music
in case I want to be a professional singer

9. to learn to read music

10. to help your vocal chords
to learn how to sing

11. because I want to sing when I grow up
to learn the basics
because you need to read notes to be a singer
because I want to be a musician

12. to improve our singing
to go on more field trips

School #6

1. because everyone likes music in some way
to learn notes, rests, etc.
to play for fun
to play for money
to express yourself
to know your options
to find out if you like music or not
to have fun
to learn the basics
to talk to others
to help each other with classwork

2. to learn to sing
music class is boring sometimes

3. to learn music notes
to play an instrument
to make your voice strong

4. music class is not important
singing in front of others is hard
music class takes up time

5. to know music
because I might want to be a music star
in case you want to be a music director or snare drum player
to have fun
to listen to music
to sing funny songs
to play an instrument

6. to play an instrument
because playing instruments sometimes makes me happy
because music has a good beat and sound
to sing out loud
to do a play
to watch movies
to test on an instrument can be scary

(School #6)
7. to learn about composers
to learn about music history
to learn music that’s really special and unique
to sing properly (mouth open and use diaphragm)
to learn rhythm
to learn notes
in case you want to be in band
to learn songs
to interact
to let our voices fly with others

8. because I want to be a singer
to learn to be a good singer
to play the boomwhackers
to do “cup raps” ??
to learn new songs
to learn notes

9. to sing
because most people like to sing
to relax
to learn about notes
to learn new words
if you want to be in band
to learn to play some instruments

10. to learn notes
to use in church
to make your voice just right
to play instruments
for fun
to play music at home or anywhere appropriate
to teach your parents something
to learn about composers
to know something about a composer if someone talks about them

11. to play the boomwhackers
to learn to play the piano
to learn what not to do when singing
in case you try out for a choir
to get ready for band class
to learn to sing out loud
(School #6)
to sing with other choir members

12. to play the boomwhackers
to listen
to learn how to play instruments
to sing out loud
to get used to being embarrassed

13. we aren’t ever going to need music class
to play guitar
to learn about old time music and new music
to sing, if it’s a song you like
to perform in front of people
for other people to enjoy your music

14. to get the blood flowing after working all day
to sing
to dance
to play the boomwhackers
to play the xylophones

15. to play instruments
to sing
for fun
to express your feelings
to make up beats
to learn different kinds of music
to learn what other people like
to learn about other people’s (composer’s?) personalities or feelings at the time

16. to play instruments
to learn to read notes

17. to sing
   if you want to be a singer when you grow up
   to not be shy anymore
   to learn notes
   to play instruments
   to learn about composers
   to get ready for Band

18. music makes me happy
    to have fun
    to go to concerts
    to sing
    to learn new stuff everyday
    to work with partners

19. to sing
    to have fun
    to perform in front of everybody
    to dance
    to be on stage
    because my music teacher is nice

20. because it’s cool
    to learn notes
    to learn words to different songs
    to travel
    to sing for people who love music just like you
    to help people
    to sing out loud
    to sing better

21. to play the keyboard
    to play songs
    to play drums
22. to know the notes
to play an instrument
to be able to do something other people can’t
to do something besides work
to take time off from school
to learn new things
to make a song by yourself

23. to know the notes
to learn to play instruments
to be a singer
in case you want to be in a band
to learn the music alphabet
to learn about new artists
for fun

24. music doesn’t help us stay alive

(School #6)

25. to learn about music
to learn songs

26. to learn the music alphabet
to learn to play an instrument
to sing

27. for fun
to play different activities
because I like my music teacher
to go on field trips
to learn to write music
to sing
learning things we need to know

28. to learn notes
to learn beats
because I want a career in music
to listen to music
to ease my mind
music is soothing
to learn to play instruments
to learn different varieties of music
to learn music that appeals to lots of different tastes

29. to use my mouth
to play instruments
to learn rhythm

30. to learn notes
to be a singer or play instruments
to sing
to learn and get a job as a singer
to know music
to sing the right words

31. to learn the notes of the staff
in case you go into the music business
to learn to play an instrument
to feel good
to make a song or learn one
to learn to recognize how a note sounds
to sing

32. to learn to read notes
for fun
to learn music
to sing
because I love my voice

33. to sing
to sing songs of the kind we like
to play instruments
to pick instruments to play
to know all the words to songs

34. to help me learn to play the violin
to learn to play at least 1 instrument
125

to occupy your time instead of drugs
to have fun
to sing more songs

35. to learn notes
because I might need it someday
to sing
to have fun
to listen to people sing
to laugh
to play instruments

36. to enjoy class
to learn notes
to sing
to know when to hit the high notes
to learn to read music
to help tell you how you feel
to feel happy or sad

37. to learn how to sing better
to learn songs
to know what I’m singing at church
to use my vocal chords better

38. to learn to play the xylophone
to teach my niece what I learned in class
to sing

39. to learn music notes
to use later in life
to sing

40. to have fun
to not be bored
to know how to read notes
to sing the right tone and the beat
to know what you sing
to feel the emotion of what you’re singing
to envision what your are singing
41. to learn notes  
to have fun  
to sing  
to keep the beat  
to have a good attitude

School #7

1. to sing songs from different cultures  
to learn words from different cultures  
for fun  
to sing songs  
to sing together  
to do things together  
to learn how to read music  
to value the teachers

2. to learn songs  
to sing  
to learn composers  
for fun  
to listen to songs  
to dance

3. to learn about different time periods  
to learn about different styles of music  
to learn about the Beatles  
to know different notes and rhythms and sounds  
to sing
to be able to read notes
to learn about music history
to learn about communicating through music
because without music the world would feel lonely and boring
because there has always been music
to learn something new

4. to learn about different composers
to learn about music
to play keyboards
to learn to sightread
to share with someone else
to learn different types of music
to listen to music
because I like my teacher

5. to learn about the kind of music there used to be
to learn things that might help in other classes
to learn about different composers
to learn what music does in the world
to learn how music started

6. to learn all kinds of music
to learn history
to learn things to tell my children and grandchildren
to learn the effect music has on the world
because music expresses more than we know
learning how music affects style, clothes, etc.

7. to learn the names of the notes
to learn about the Beatles
to learn songs
to learned how music started and ended

8. to learn about Michael Jackson
to learn about the Supremes
to learn about Elvis

9. to get involved
because music inspires you
to learn how Michael Jackson became a star at a young age
because life wouldn’t be right without music
10. to learn about different types of music
   to learn to tell each type of music apart when they play it
   to learn the variety of songs
   to learn about music of your generation

11. to dance
    listening to different kinds of music
    to let me be open to new kinds of music
    to learn different types of music
    to see pictures of different artists

12. to listen to music
    to learn about music that black people created

13. to learn what happened to composers and singers

14. to be involved in what we’re doing
    to watch videos
    to see pictures

(School #7)

15. to learn music history
    to learn things that are important

16. to keep music from being forgotten
    to learn about elvis, chuck berry, jimi hendrix
    to learn today’s music

17. to learn history

18. to learn American history

19. to know what kind of music came before now
    to learn how one style of music became another
APPENDIX D:

EXAMPLE STATEMENTS FROM INSTRUMENT CREATION PHASE,

WITH RESEARCHER MODIFICATIONS
Original Statement: “What I value is that it helps me remember things and my notes. Because I like music and the piano. I thought I would never learning but I got it fast. What I value is my teacher because she helps me play and she puts more challenges. She puts more challenges in front of me because she likes me to try more songs. What I value is my friends/classmates, because they ask me to help them and I get to play different songs and keep all kinds of different notes in my self. What I value is my performances because it helps me not to by shy and helps me remember every it helps me be happy because when I play I get happy.”

Researcher’s re-wording:

1. To help me remember things
2. To enjoy music
3. To play the piano
4. Because I like my teacher
5. To be challenged
6. To be with friends/classmates
7. To help others
8. To perform
9. To overcome shyness
10. To be happy

Original Statement: (What I value) “I think the instruments. The instruments is mostly about music because it makes the beat, rhythm, and other things. What I value is to be able to read the music notes. If you don’t know how to read the music notes then you can’t play the bells or the instruments or nothing like that.”
Researcher’s re-wording:

1. To use instruments
2. To learn about beat and rhythm
3. To learn to read music

Original Statement: “Valuable is the music we learn all these years. Because we learn how to play music, how to listen to music. We learn where some music comes from. Valuable is the instruments we play. Because a school without instruments is nothing because music is a great thing to learn.”

Researcher’s re-wording:

1. To learn to play music
2. To learn how to listen to music
3. To learn where different music comes from
4. To play instruments
5. To learn music

Original Statement: “What I value about music is learning how to read notes and how to play them. To me learning how to read notes and how to play them, it is a lot. It means a lot to me because I learn how to play them and I never know when in my life I’m going to have to play them. What I value is learning how to play the bells. When I played the bells it was cool. I think it was cool because I had never played bells, and thank you to my teacher, now I know how to play them.

Researcher’s re-wording:

1. To learn how to read notes
2. Because reading music might be useful later in life
3. To learn to play bells
4. To play an instrument I had never played before
APPENDIX E:

SUBJECTS’ STATEMENTS FROM INSTRUMENT CREATION PHASE,
ORGANIZED QUALITATIVELY BY CATEGORY
PSYCHOLOGICAL:

because music expresses more than we know
to express yourself
music expresses different emotions
because music helps form your personality
to express myself
to work out problems
to express my feelings
to get things off your chest
to let your thoughts and feelings flow
because listening to the wrong kind of music will change who you are
to show your feelings
to cheer you up
to benefit your personal life and personality
because music helps if you’re lonely or hurt
to benefit our personal lives
to calm down, settle down
to help when you feel bad
because playing instruments sometimes makes me happy
to relax
to get the blood flowing after working all day
to express your feelings
to learn about other people’s personalities or feelings at the time they wrote their song
music makes me happy
to ease my mind
music is soothing
to help tell you how you feel
to feel happy or sad
to feel the emotion of what you’re singing
to have a good attitude
to learn about communicating through music

because it is important to have music in your life
because music is part of life
because you hear music every day
music brings meaning to life
because it helps my life
music helps you in life
to learn how music affects your life
to learn how music affects your life
to learn how music affects your life
to learn how music affects your life, good and bad
because without music people would be bored
to make musical memories
to realize how much music is in your life
to occupy your time instead of drugs
because without music the world would feel lonely and boring
because life wouldn’t be right without music
to learn the effect music has on the world

to have fun
to be happy
for fun
for fun
for fun
for fun
to have fun
to have fun
to have fun
for fun
for fun
for fun
for fun
for fun
because it is fun
to play for fun
to have fun
for fun
to laugh
to enjoy class
to not be bored
to have fun

to be okay at something
to feel good about myself
to display talent
to gain self-confidence
to overcome shyness
to overcome shyness
to learn to not be scared to sing in front of others
to feel like you can do anything you want to do
to not be shy anymore

INTEGRATIVE:

to be with friends/classmates
to talk
to participate with a group of people
to work with partners
to do group projects
to talk to friends
to talk to others
to help others
to teach someone else about styles
to sing in a group
to talk to others
to help each other with classwork
to interact
to let our voices fly with others
to work with partners
to help people
to teach my niece what I learned in class
to do things together
to share with someone else
to learn things to tell my children and grandchildren

because I like my teacher
to get encouragement from the teacher
because the teachers are nice
because I like my teacher
to learn from the teacher
to have a good teacher
because of the teachers
because my teacher is nice
because the teacher is kind
because the teacher makes music fun
because of the teaching
because my music teacher is nice
because I like my music teacher
to value the teachers
COMMUNICATIVE:

- to put on plays
- to participate in plays and talent shows
- to do a play

- to perform
- to perform in a concert
- to perform in front of others
- to play for my parents
- to learn to perform
- to play for other people
- to entertain people
- to perform songs with motions
- to use your voice to have a big effect on people
- to sing for other people
- because music brings joy to people
- to relax others by singing to them
- to entertain through music
- to perform in front of people
- for other people to enjoy your music
- to perform in front of everybody
- to be on stage
- to sing for people who love music just like you
ACADEMIC: (NON-MUSICAL)

to play different activities
to be challenged
to learn something (reading music) that not everyone can do
to learn new things
to learn new things
to experience new things
to have something to practice
to learn something new
to be challenged with difficult work
to do a lot of different things
to learn something interesting and cool
to learn and get smarter
because music teaches every part of your brain
because it’s fun to learn different things
to learn new words
to learn new stuff everyday
to be able to do something other people can’t
learning things we need to know
to get involved
to have hands-on experience

to earn grades
because it is an easy credit
to get a good grade
to earn a grade
to pass the class
to get a good grade

music can help you do things like homework, read, sleep
music class helps me remember things
to learn responsibility
to work on your own projects
to go to the library
to do research on the computer
to set goals
to learn things that might help in other classes

ACADEMIC: (MUSICAL)

- to learn about composers
- to learn about people (composers?) that you didn’t know about before
- to learn about composers
- to compare the music of different composers
- to “meet” different composers and learn about their lives
- to learn how composers felt when they wrote their music
- to learn about composers
- to know about composers/history
- to learn about composers
- to learn about past composers and how they affect music today
- to learn how composers affect culture
- to learn about composers
- to learn about different composers
- to learn about composers
- to know something about a composer if someone talks about them
- to learn about composers
- to learn about different composers

- to learn to read notes
- to learn notes
- to learn how to read notes
- to learn how to read notes
- to learn how to play notes
- to learn how to read notes
- to understand notes
- to learn rhythms
- to learn to read music
- to learn to read notes
- to learn to read notes
- to learn to count notes
- to learn notes
- to learn to play notes
- to read music
- to learn to read notes
to learn to count rhythms
to read musical notes
to read music
to learn the notes for playing the piano
to learn notes
to learn rhythms
to learn to count rhythms
to learn to count rhythms
to learn how to read music
to learn about music notes
to learn music notes
to learn how notes work and sound
to learn notes
to learn notes
to learn notes
to learn notes
to learn notes
to learn notes
to learn chords
to learn to read music
to learn rhythm
to learn beats and rhythms
because you need to read notes to be a singer
to learn notes, rests, etc.
to learn rhythm
to learn about musical styles
to experience different types of music
to learn musical styles
to learn about all different kinds of music
to learn about different kinds of music
to learn about all kinds of music
to learn to appreciate different music
to know the differences between artists
to learn about different time periods
to learn about music from other countries
to discover different types of music
to listen to different kinds of music
to learn songs from different cultures
to learn musical styles
to learn what styles I like and don’t like
to learn about other countries
to learn different musical styles
   to learn about different styles of music
   to learn about different styles of music
   to learn styles of music
   to be able to identify the style of a song on the radio
   to learn about what types of music other people like
   learning different styles of music
   to learn all types of music
   to learn different kinds of music
   to learn what other people like
   to learn about new artists
   to learn music that appeals to lots of different tastes
   10
   to sing songs from different cultures
   to learn words from different cultures
   listening to different kinds of music
   to let me be open to new kinds of music

   to learn about music that black people created
   to learn how music from different eras sounds different
   to learn where different music comes from
   learn about past music to appreciate today’s music
   to learn how composers impact today’s music
   to learn about the background of modern day music
   to compare the music of the past to music of today
   to learn music history
   to learn songs about different events
   to learn how music originated
   to learn about past and present music
   to learn about important people in orchestras
   to learn who some musicians are
   to learn the history of music
   to learn about different musicians
   to learn how musicians came to the music business
   to learn about musicians from the past
   to learn about music history
   to learn about old time music and new music
   because there has always been music
   to learn about the kind of music there used to be
   to learn how music started
   learning how music affects style, clothes, etc.
   to learn about Michael Jackson
   to learn about the Supremes
to learn about Elvis

to see pictures of different artists
to learn about the Beatles
to see pictures
to learn about music of your generation
to learn what happened to composers and singers
to learn how Michael Jackson became a star at a young age
to learn about elvis, chuck berry, jimi hendrix
to keep music from being forgotten
to learn today’s music
to learn history
to learn American history
to know what kind of music came before now
to learn how one style of music became another

because counting notes is easy
it’s something everyone can do
because it is easy
because everyone likes music in some way
MUSICAL-ARTISTIC (MUSICING)

to learn to write a song
to learn the ‘musician’s language’
to learn musical concepts
to learn to write a song
to learn to play music
to learn about elements of music
to learn about music
to learn to write a song
to learn to write music
to write a song
to make an instrument
to make a rhythm
to understand music better
to write a song
to learn more respect for music
because I like music
to enjoy music
to use what you’ve learned about music
to learn how important (music) is
to understand music
to write songs of different styles
to learn that music is important
to expand my knowledge about music
to learn the basics
to find out if you like music or not
to know music
to learn music that’s really special and unique
to teach your parents something
to play music at home or anywhere appropriate
to make up beats
to learn words to different songs
because it’s cool
to learn about music
to learn to write music
to know music
to make a song or learn one


to sing
to sing
to sing
to learn songs
to learn to sing
10
to sing
to learn new songs
to learn more songs
to sing
to sing
to learn how to sing well
to learn to sing better
to learn to sing
to learn to sing
to sing
to learn to sing
to learn to sing
to sing
to learn to sing
to sing
to get better at singing
to sing different types of songs
to sing
to learn how to sing
to improve our singing
to learn to sing
to sing funny songs
to sing out loud
to learn songs
to learn to be a good singer
to learn new songs
to sing
because most people like to sing
to learn to sing out loud
to sing with the choir members
to sing out loud
to sing, if it’s a song you like
to sing
to sing out loud
to sing better
to learn songs
to sing the right words
because I love my voice
to know all the words to songs
to sing
to sing songs of the kind we like
to sing more songs

to know what you sing

to envision what you are singing

to listen to music

to hear the sound of the instruments

to learn how to listen

to learn how to listen

to listen to music

to listen to music

for the sound of the music

to listen to music you like

because listening to music is joyful

to listen to music

because music has a good beat and sound

to learn to recognize how a note sounds

to listen to people sing


to learn to play handbells

to play the piano

because the piano wants me to play it (driven to play, etc)

to learn how to play the handbells

playing bells is cool

to play an instrument I had never played before

to play different instruments

to play the instruments

to use the instruments

to play handbells

to learn to play instruments

to learn to play handbells

to learn to play instruments

to learn to play handbells

to play instruments

to learn to play handbells

to play instruments

to learn how to play instruments

to play handbells

to play instruments

to learn to play instruments correctly

to use instruments


to learn to play the piano
to learn to play the piano
to play instruments
to learn to play the piano
to learn to play an instrument
to learn to play the piano
to learn to play the piano
to learn to play the piano
to learn to play the piano
to spend time playing instruments
to learn to play the piano
to play the instruments
to play instruments
to learn to play instruments
to play an instrument
to play instruments
to play a song
to play instruments
to play an instrument
to play instruments, drums
in case you want to play an instrument
to help me play the guitar
to play instruments of different types
to learn how to play any instrument
to play the boomwhackers
to do “cup raps” ??
to play the boomwhackers
to play the xylophones

to play music at home or anywhere appropriate

to dance to music
to dance
to dance
to dance
to dance
to dance

to practice good posture
to learn breathing for singing
to learn to control your voice
to sing songs and “stretch our vocal chords”
to develop a good voice
to learn to sing/use your lungs
to train my voice
to help your vocal chords
to make your voice strong
to sing properly (mouth open and use diaphragm)
to make your voice just right
to learn what not to do when singing
to use my mouth
to use my vocal chords better

FUTURE GOALS:

to learn something you might use later in life
reading music might be useful later in life
some people might want to be singers as adults
music is useful later in life
to use later if you want to be a musician
to use later in life to play an instrument
to be a music teacher in the future
to use in the future
to use in the future
so you can sing in a choir when you’re older
because it is a sample of what music class will be like in later grades
to help us when we are older
in case I want to be a professional singer
because I want to sing when I grow up
to know your options
in case you want to be a music director or snare drum player
in case you want to be in band
if you want to be in band
in case you try out for a choir
to get ready for band class
if you want to be a singer when you grow up
to get ready for Band
in case you want to be in a band
because I might need it someday
to get a job in the music business
to become a professional musician
to help learn to be a musician
to be a musician
because I want to be a musician
to play for money
because I might want to be a music star
because I want to be a singer
because I want a career in music
to learn and get a job as a singer
in case you go into the music business

147 unambiguous statements
APPENDIX F:
SELECTED STATEMENTS
BY CATEGORY,
USED IN THE
INSTRUMENT CREATION PHASE
SURVEY
PILOT STATEMENTS BY FACTOR CATEGORY:

Psychological:
1. To express my feelings
2. To relax
3. To get things off my chest
4. To work out problems
5. To feel the emotion of the music
6. To help form your personality
7. To learn how music affects your life
8. To bring meaning to life
9. To have fun
10. To enjoy class
11. To feel good about myself
12. To show talent
13. To get self-confidence
14. To be good at something
15. To learn not to be shy

Integrative (Social):
1. To be with friends and/or classmates
2. To participate with a group of people
3. To talk to others
4. To sing or play in a group
5. To help each other with classwork
6. To do things together
7. To work with partners or a group
8. To share with someone else
9. To do group projects
Integrative (Social) continued
10. To teach someone else what I learn
11. To get encouragement
12. To learn from the teacher
13. To enjoy being with the teacher
14. To have a good teacher
15. To learn how to communicate through music

Communicative:
1. To perform in a concert
2. To play or sing for other people
3. To entertain people
4. To use your music to have a big effect on people
5. To bring joy to people
6. To be on stage
7. To perform in front of everybody
8. To sing or play for people who love music just like you
9. To relax others by playing or singing to them
10. To perform for my family
11. To put on plays
12. To participate in talent shows
13. To have others listen to me
14. To share my talent with others
15. To express the composer’s thoughts and feelings in the music

Academic (Non-Musical):
1. To be challenged
2. To learn something that not everyone can do
3. To experience new things
Academic (Non-Musical) continued:

4. To get smarter
5. To have fun learning different things
6. To get involved
7. To have a hands-on experience
8. To learn new stuff every day
9. To learn something interesting and cool
10. To earn a grade
11. To get an easy credit
12. To learn responsibility
13. To go to the library / do research on the computer
14. To learn things that might help in other classes
15. To set goals

Academic (Musical):

1. To learn about composers
2. To compare the music of different composers
3. To learn to read notes
4. To learn to read music
5. To learn beats and rhythms
6. To learn how notes work and sound
7. To learn different musical styles
8. To learn about different kinds of music
9. To learn about what types of music other people like
10. To learn about music from other countries
11. To learn how music originated
12. To learn about the background of modern day music
13. To learn how music affects culture (style, clothes, hair, etc.)
Academic (Musical) continued:
14. To learn about the music of your generation
15. To keep music from being forgotten

Musical-Artistic (Musicing):
1. To learn to write a song
2. To learn the musician’s language
3. To find out if you like music or not
4. To understand music better
5. To sing
6. To learn to sing better
7. To train my voice and vocal chords
8. To learn new songs
9. To listen to music
10. To hear the sound of the music
11. To play instruments
12. To play an instrument I had never played before
13. To learn lots of different instruments
14. To play music at home or somewhere else
15. To dance

Future Goals:
1. To learn something you might use later in life
2. To be able to play an instrument in the future
3. To be able to read music in the future
4. To get ready for Band or Choir, or Orchestra class
5. To be a singer as an adult
6. To know your options
7. To be a music teacher someday
Future Goals continued:

8. To use in case you want to play music when you grow up
9. To be able to try out for a choir
10. To get a job in the music business
11. To be a musician some day
12. To get a job as a singer
13. To be a music star
14. To play in a band someday
15. To get a career in music
APPENDIX G:

PILOT MUSIC MEANING

SURVEY
Meaning Survey

School Name: ____________________   Grade (circle):  6   7   8   Gender (circle):  Male   Female

Each of the short statements below describe what you might VALUE or FIND IMPORTANT or ENJOY about Music Class. For each statement, please circle HOW MUCH this describes how you feel about your music class:

Really Agree,    Sort of Agree,    Sort of Disagree, or   Really Disagree.

Please think about each response. We want to find out what Music Class means for YOU. There are no right or wrong answers. Please answer honestly, we want to know how you really feel (not what you think someone else would want you to say).

Thank you for your help! 😊

1. To express my feelings
   Really Agree    Sort of Agree    Sort of Disagree    Really Disagree

2. To perform in a concert
   Really Agree    Sort of Agree    Sort of Disagree    Really Disagree

3. To be challenged
   Really Agree    Sort of Agree    Sort of Disagree    Really Disagree

4. To be with friends and/or classmates
   Really Agree    Sort of Agree    Sort of Disagree    Really Disagree

5. To learn something you might use later in life
   Really Agree    Sort of Agree    Sort of Disagree    Really Disagree

6. To learn about composers
   Really Agree    Sort of Agree    Sort of Disagree    Really Disagree

7. To sing
   Really Agree    Sort of Agree    Sort of Disagree    Really Disagree

8. To experience new things
   Really Agree    Sort of Agree    Sort of Disagree    Really Disagree

9. To relax
   Really Agree    Sort of Agree    Sort of Disagree    Really Disagree

10. To participate with a group of people
    Really Agree    Sort of Agree    Sort of Disagree    Really Disagree
<p>| 11. To learn to read notes | Really Agree | Sort of Agree | Sort of Disagree | Really Disagree |
| 12. To learn to write a song | Really Agree | Sort of Agree | Sort of Disagree | Really Disagree |
| 13. To talk to others | Really Agree | Sort of Agree | Sort of Disagree | Really Disagree |
| 14. To be a singer as an adult | Really Agree | Sort of Agree | Sort of Disagree | Really Disagree |
| 15. To get things off my chest | Really Agree | Sort of Agree | Sort of Disagree | Really Disagree |
| 16. To learn about the music of your generation | Really Agree | Sort of Agree | Sort of Disagree | Really Disagree |
| 17. To learn something that not everyone can do | Really Agree | Sort of Agree | Sort of Disagree | Really Disagree |
| 18. To play or sing for other people | Really Agree | Sort of Agree | Sort of Disagree | Really Disagree |
| 19. To learn beats and rhythms | Really Agree | Sort of Agree | Sort of Disagree | Really Disagree |
| 20. To know your options | Really Agree | Sort of Agree | Sort of Disagree | Really Disagree |
| 21. To find out if you like music or not | Really Agree | Sort of Agree | Sort of Disagree | Really Disagree |
| 22. To sing or play in a group | Really Agree | Sort of Agree | Sort of Disagree | Really Disagree |
| 23. To work out problems | Really Agree | Sort of Agree | Sort of Disagree | Really Disagree |
| 24. To get smarter | Really Agree | Sort of Agree | Sort of Disagree | Really Disagree |
| 25. To learn to sing better | Really Agree | Sort of Agree | Sort of Disagree | Really Disagree |
| 26. To entertain people | Really Agree | Sort of Agree | Sort of Disagree | Really Disagree |
| 27. To get a career in music | Really Agree | Sort of Agree | Sort of Disagree | Really Disagree |
| 28. To play instruments | Really Agree | Sort of Agree | Sort of Disagree | Really Disagree |
| 29. To help each other with classwork | Really Agree | Sort of Agree | Sort of Disagree | Really Disagree |
| 30. To learn to read music | Really Agree | Sort of Agree | Sort of Disagree | Really Disagree |
| 31. To have fun learning different things | Really Agree | Sort of Agree | Sort of Disagree | Really Disagree |
| 32. To keep music from being forgotten | Really Agree | Sort of Agree | Sort of Disagree | Really Disagree |
| 33. To learn how to communicate through music | Really Agree | Sort of Agree | Sort of Disagree | Really Disagree |
| 34. To get involved | Really Agree | Sort of Agree | Sort of Disagree | Really Disagree |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>35. To feel the emotion of the music</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36. To play music at home or somewhere else</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37. To do things together</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38. To get ready for Band or Choir or Orchestra class</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39. To express the composer's thoughts and feelings in the music</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40. To be able to read music in the future</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41. To use your music to have a big effect on people</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42. To learn new songs</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43. To help form your personality</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44. To have a hands-on experience</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45. To compare the music of different composers</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46. To get a job in the music business</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47. To work with partners or a group</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48. To learn how notes work and sound</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49. To share my talent with others</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50 To be able to try out for a choir</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51. To have a good teacher</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52. To learn new stuff every day</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53. To learn different musical styles</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54. To learn how music affects your life</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55. To learn something interesting and cool</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56. To earn a grade</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>57. To hear the sound of the music</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>58. To share with someone else</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>59. To bring joy to people</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60. To bring meaning to life</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61. To train my voice and vocal chords</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>62. To be able to play an instrument in the future</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>63. To participate in talent shows</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64. To learn about the background of modern day music</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65. To do group projects</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>66. To be a music teacher someday</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>67. To be on stage</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>68. To have fun</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>69. To play an instrument I had never played before</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70. To learn responsibility</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>71. To use in case you want to play music when you grow up</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>72. To teach someone else what I learn</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Statement</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>73.</td>
<td>To learn about different kinds of music</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>74.</td>
<td>To perform in front of everybody</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75.</td>
<td>To be a music star</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>76.</td>
<td>To enjoy class</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>77.</td>
<td>To dance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>78.</td>
<td>To listen to music</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>79.</td>
<td>To get an easy credit</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80.</td>
<td>To sing or play for people who love music just like you</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>81.</td>
<td>To feel good about myself</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>82.</td>
<td>To learn about music from other countries</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>83.</td>
<td>To go to the library / do research on the computer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>84.</td>
<td>To learn from the teacher</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>85.</td>
<td>To play in a band someday</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>86.</td>
<td>To relax others by playing or singing to them</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>87.</td>
<td>To learn how music originated</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>88.</td>
<td>To show talent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>89.</td>
<td>To learn the musician's language</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90.</td>
<td>To get a job as a singer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>91.</td>
<td>To learn lots of different instruments</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>92.</td>
<td>To learn things that might help in other classes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>93.</td>
<td>To get self-confidence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Question</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>94. To learn how music affects culture (style, clothes, hair, etc.)</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95. To perform for my family</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>96. To be a musician some day</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>97. To understand music better</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>98. To get encouragement</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>99. To set goals</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100. To put on plays</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>101. To learn about what types of music other people like</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>102. To be good at something</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>103. To have others listen to me</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>104. To enjoy being with the teacher</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>105. To learn not to be shy</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX H:

ROTATED FACTOR MATRIX,

PILOT STUDY
Rotated Factor Matrix, after 5th Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>.572</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.768</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.518</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.688</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.766</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.551</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.785</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.772</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.546</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.714</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.639</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td></td>
<td>.725</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.507</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.698</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.648</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.745</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Rotated Factor Matrix, after 5th Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td></td>
<td>.694</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.753</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.641</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.777</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.599</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.813</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td></td>
<td>.674</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55</td>
<td></td>
<td>.755</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>59</td>
<td></td>
<td>.638</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60</td>
<td></td>
<td>.725</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>62</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.547</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>71</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.551</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>73</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.588</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>74</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.545</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>78</td>
<td></td>
<td>.613</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>81</td>
<td></td>
<td>.722</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Rotated Factor Matrix, after 5\textsuperscript{th} Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>85</td>
<td></td>
<td>.794</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>93</td>
<td></td>
<td>.832</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>96</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.813</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>98</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.776</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>99</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.769</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>102</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.687</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX I:

STATEMENTS IN THE 5

FACTOR CATEGORIES,

AFTER PILOT
5 Factors after Pilot Survey

Key: 1st number = numbered for organization; 2nd number: statement number in the pilot survey; [ ] = word added to statement after the pilot’s factor analysis; { } = entire statement added to factor category after the pilot’s factor analysis; ( ) = words removed from statement after pilot’s factor analysis

Factor 1: (PSYCHOLOGICAL)

1. 49. To share my talent with others
2. 55. To learn something interesting and cool
3. 59. To bring joy to people
4. 60. To bring meaning to life
5. 78. To listen to music
6. 81. To feel good about myself
7. 93. To get self-confidence
8. 98. To get encouragement
9. 99. To set goals
10. 102. To be good at something

Factor 2: (FUTURE MUSIC GOALS)

11. 22. To sing or play in a group [someday]
12. 27. To get a career in music
13. 38. To get ready for Band or Choir or Orchestra class
14. 41. To use your music to have a big effect on people
15. 46. To get a job in the music business
16. 62. To be able to play an instrument in the future
17. 71. To use in case you want to play music when you grow up
18. 85. To play in a band someday
19. 96. To be a musician someday
20. {To have a career in the music industry}

Factor 3: (ACADEMIC-MUSICAL)

21. 6. To learn about composers
22. 11. To learn to read notes
23. 19. To learn beats and rhythms
24. 30. To learn to read music
25. 40. To be able to read music in the future
26. 48. To learn how notes work and sound
27. 73. To learn about different kinds of music
28. {To know about the history of music}
29. {To learn about composers’ lives}
30. {To learn how music is written}

Factor 4: (PERFORMING/MUSIC-MAKING)

31. 2. To perform in a concert
32. 7. To sing
33. 12. To learn to write a song
34. 14. To be a singer as an adult
35. 15. To get things off my chest
36. 18. To play or sing for other people
37. 26. To entertain people
38. 74. To perform in front of everybody
39. {To perform on instruments}
40. {To let out my feelings when I make music}

Factor 5: (SOCIAL/BELONGINGNESS)

41. 4. To be with friends (or classmates)
42. 13. To talk to others
43. 29. To help each other with classwork
44. 47. To work with partners (or a group)
45. {To make music with friends}
46. {To do group work}
47. {To enjoy being with classmates}
48. {To socialize}
49. {To get together with friends}
50. {To work together}
APPENDIX J:

FINAL MMS,

PAPER SURVEY
Meaning Survey

School Name: ______________________   Grade (circle):  6   7   8       Gender (circle):  Male    Female

Each of the short statements below describe what you might VALUE or FIND IMPORTANT or ENJOY about Music Class. For each statement, please circle HOW MUCH this describes how you feel about your music class:

Really Agree,  Sort of Agree,  Sort of Disagree, or  Really Disagree.

Please think about each response. We want to find out what Music Class means for YOU. There are no right or wrong answers. Please answer honestly, we want to know how you really feel (not what you think someone else would want you to say).

Thank you for your help! ☺

1. To learn something interesting and cool
   Really Agree    Sort of Agree    Sort of Disagree    Really Disagree

2. To perform in front of everybody
   Really Agree    Sort of Agree    Sort of Disagree    Really Disagree

3. To play in a band someday
   Really Agree    Sort of Agree    Sort of Disagree    Really Disagree

4. To do group work
   Really Agree    Sort of Agree    Sort of Disagree    Really Disagree

5. To be a singer as an adult
   Really Agree    Sort of Agree    Sort of Disagree    Really Disagree

6. To make music with friends
   Really Agree    Sort of Agree    Sort of Disagree    Really Disagree

7. To bring joy to people
   Really Agree    Sort of Agree    Sort of Disagree    Really Disagree

8. To learn about different kinds of music
   Really Agree    Sort of Agree    Sort of Disagree    Really Disagree

9. To play or sing for other people
   Really Agree    Sort of Agree    Sort of Disagree    Really Disagree

10. To talk to others
    Really Agree    Sort of Agree    Sort of Disagree    Really Disagree
<p>| | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11. To learn to read music</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. To sing or play in a group someday</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. To know about the history of music</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. To learn beats and rhythms</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. To be good at something</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. To help each other with classwork</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. To learn to read notes</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. To use your music to have a big effect on people</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. To set goals</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. To perform in a concert</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. To get ready for Band or Choir or Orchestra class</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. To feel good about myself</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. To share my talent with others</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24. To get a job in the music business</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25. To learn about composers</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26. To work together</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27. To listen to music</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28. To get a career in music</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29. To bring meaning to life</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30. To be able to play an instrument in the future</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Survey Question</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31. To get together with friends</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32. To get self-confidence</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33. To enjoy being with classmates</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34. To be a musician someday</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35. To learn how music is written</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36. To get encouragement</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37. To work with partners</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38. To learn to write a song</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39. To entertain people</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40. To have a career in the music industry</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41. To learn about composers’ lives</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42. To socialize</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43. To learn how notes work and sound</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44. To sing</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45. To get things off my chest</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46. To use in case you want to play music when you grow up</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47. To be with friends</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48. To let out my feelings when I make music</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49. To be able to read music in the future</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50. To perform on instruments</td>
<td>Really Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Agree</td>
<td>Sort of Disagree</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

THANK YOU!! ☺️
APPENDIX K:

INSTRUCTIONS FOR GIVING

THE ONLINE MMS
INSTRUCTIONS FOR GIVING THE ONLINE
“MUSIC MEANING SURVEY”

• GO TO www.musiceducationsurveys.com/virginia

• Please read the instruction page aloud to the students

• Go through the Sample question together, lead them through clicking on the answer that BEST describes their feelings. (NOTICE this is FORCED-CHOICE, the survey will not let them select more than one answer for each question, so students must decide on one answer.) Please do not leave questions blank.

• Let students know they DO NOT have to participate and may stop at any time. They should work quietly on other homework or read a book until the other students have finished. Please don’t offer “playing on the computer” as an alternate activity…. We want taking the survey to be the best-sounding option!

• When they have finished the survey, they MUST click on “SUBMIT” to send their data to me. IT IS IMPORTANT THAT STUDENTS DON’T ALL CLICK “SUBMIT” AT THE SAME TIME. Ask them to raise their hands when they are finished, so you can make sure
they’re clicking “submit” one at a time. Otherwise the flood of data may be too much for our mainframe to handle!!

THANKS SO MUCH FOR YOUR HELP!!! I WILL SEND YOU AN UPDATE ON THE RESULTS ONCE ALL THE DATA IS IN FROM EVERYONE!
APPENDIX L:

TEACHER ASSENT

FORM, PARENT/STUDENT CONSENT FORMS,

AND SITE AUTHORIZATION LETTER
Dear Teacher,

You are being asked to participate with your class in the research project “The Meaning of the Music Education Experience to Middle School General Music Students” Your participation in this research study will be to issue and collect permission slips from students, assist in obtaining site authorization from administrators, distributing and collecting the surveys, and mailing the completed surveys and permission forms back to me in the envelope provided.

Please keep one copy of this letter for your records and return the signed copy to me. If you would like further information, please do not hesitate to contact me: Virginia Wayman, M.M. at (520) 891-6530. If you have questions concerning your rights as a research subject, you may call the University of Arizona Human Subjects Protection Program office at (520) 626-6721.

By signing this form you agree to the following:

1) I understand that I am to administer the survey only to students whose parents have returned a signed permission slip. I understand that students that do not participate are not to be penalized in any way. I should suggest an alternate activity to students who don’t participate, such as working quietly on other homework or silent reading.

2) The benefits to your students are that they will be encouraged to think about their thoughts and feelings about music class. In addition, the survey may encourage discussion about the topics contained in the survey, the students may enjoy participating in research, and the students may gain insight into their attitudes about music and music education. There are no known risks to participation in this project. There will be no compensation to you or your students for participating in this survey, only my sincere thanks.

3) Before giving my consent by signing this form, the methods, inconveniences, risks, and benefits have been explained to me and my questions have been answered. I may ask questions at any time and I am free to withdraw from the project at any time. My participation in this project may be ended by the investigator for reasons that would be explained. This consent form will be filed in an area designated by the Human Subjects Committee with access restricted by the principal investigator, Virginia Wayman, M.M., or authorized representative of the Music Department. I do not give up any of my legal rights by signing this form.

Thank you very much, I very much appreciate your help!

Sincerely,

Virginia Wayman

Teacher Signature: ___________________________ Date: ___________________________
Parent/Minor Consent Letter

Dear Parent or Guardian,

Hi! My name is Virginia Wayman, I’m a doctoral student at the University of Arizona. I’m working on a research study that seeks to discover what middle school students think about their music class. It is titled, “The Meaning of the Music Education Experience to Middle School General Music Students.” To do this, I have prepared a survey that I am giving to students across the United States. I hope to survey approximately 300 students for this project. I would really appreciate your permission for your child to fill out this survey. I have provided two copies of the consent letter. Please retain one copy for your records and return the other, along with the signed permission slip, to your student’s music teacher.

During his/her regular music class, your child’s teacher will hand out the survey, asking for students’ perspectives on their school music classes. The survey will only be given to students who agree to participate and whose parents/guardians have given consent. The surveys will then be collected and returned to me in Tucson, Arizona. The survey should take only about 15 minutes to complete.

There are no known risks to filling out this survey. The benefits to your child are that students will be encouraged to think about their thoughts and feelings about music class. In addition, the survey may encourage discussion about the topics contained in the survey, the students may enjoy participating in research, and the students may gain insight into their attitudes about music and music education. There will be no compensation to you or your child for participating in this survey, only my sincere thanks.

Your child’s participation is completely voluntary. He/she may choose not to fill out the survey, and my stop at any time. If you or your child choose not to participate, he/she will be asked to work quietly at his/her desk, perhaps silent reading or other homework, until the participating students have finished. There will be no penalty for not participating; your child’s grade or standing in music class will not be affected by whether or not he/she participates.

All information your child provides will be kept confidential. No students’ names will be put on the surveys. I am interested in students’ information, not their names. The surveys will only be seen by myself, my professors and your child’s music teacher (for collection purposes only).

Please keep this letter for your records and return the permission slip to your child’s music teacher. If you would like further information, please do not hesitate to contact me: Virginia Wayman, M.M. at (520) 891-6530. If you have questions concerning your child’s rights as a research subject, you may call the University of Arizona Human Subjects Protection Program office at (520) 626-6721.

Thank you very much for your help, I really appreciate it!

Sincerely,

Virginia Wayman
University of Arizona
AUTHORIZATION

Before giving my consent by signing this form, the methods, inconveniences, risks, and benefits have been explained to me and my questions have been answered. I may ask questions at any time and I am free to withdraw my child from the project at any time without causing bad feelings or affecting his/her education. My child’s participation in this project may be ended by the investigator for reasons that would be explained. This consent form will be filed in an area designated by the Human Subjects Committee with access restricted by the principal investigator, Virginia Wayman, M.M., or authorized representative of the Music Department. I do not give up any of my or my child’s legal rights by signing this form.

________________________________________________
Student's Name (printed)

______________________________________
Parent/Legal Guardian’s Signature       Date

FOR THE STUDENT:

Your mother/father has given permission for you to fill out this survey. We are trying to find out what students like you think about their music classes. We hope to use this information to make music classes better. The information you give us will not be shared with your teacher, and will not affect your grade in music class or anything else. You will not be asked to put your name on your paper. If you agree to participate, please follow your teacher’s instructions.
You do not have to be in this research study and you can stop at any time.

Child’s
Signature________________________________________Date_________________
SITE AUTHORIZATION LETTER

Name: ____________________________________________
Title: ____________________________________________
District: __________________________________________
School: __________________________________________

This letter is to authorize Virginia Wayman, M.M. to conduct the research study, “The Meaning of the Music Education Experience to Middle School General Music Students” at the above-named middle school. I authorize Ms. Wayman to use the data collected in her dissertation document and any subsequent publication of the results.

I understand that there are no known risks to students in filling out this questionnaire. Benefits may be that students will be encouraged to think about their thoughts and feelings about music class. In addition, the survey may encourage discussion about the topics contained in the survey, the students may enjoy participating in research, and the students may gain insight into their attitudes about music and music education. I understand there will be no compensation to students or myself for participation.

I understand that student participation in this study is completely voluntary and that students will participate only with the written permission of their parent or guardian. All information students provide will be kept confidential. No students’ names will appear on the surveys. The surveys will only be seen by Virginia Wayman, her professors and the participating music teacher (for collection purposes only). I understand that the school name and music teacher’s name will appear in the dissertation document and any subsequent publication of the results.

For further information, please contact: Virginia Wayman, M.M. at (520) 891-6530. For questions concerning your students’ rights as a research subject, you may call the University of Arizona Human Subjects Protection Program office at (520) 626-6721.

Signature: ____________________________________________ Date ___________________

Phone number: ________________________________
APPENDIX M:
HUMAN SUBJECTS
AUTHORIZATION LETTER
Virginia Wayman  
Advisor: Donald Hamann, Ph.D.  
Department of Music  
P.O. Box 210064  

RE: BSC B05 12 THE MEANING OF THE MUSIC EDUCATION EXPERIENCE TO MIDDLE SCHOOL GENERAL MUSIC STUDENTS  

Dear Ms. Wayman:  

We received your research proposal as cited above. The procedures to be followed in this study pose no more than minimal risk to participating subjects and have been reviewed by the Institutional Review Board (IRB) through an Expedited Review procedure as cited in the regulations issued by the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (45 CFR Part 46.110(b)(1)) based on their inclusion under research category 7. Although full Committee review is not required, a brief summary of the project procedures is submitted to the Committee for their endorsement and/or comment, if any, after administrative approval is granted. This project is approved with an expiration date of 18 January 2006. Please make copies of the attached IRB stamped consenting documents to obtain consent from your subjects. Note: Please provide to this office site authorizations from school districts and school principals as dictated by local requirements prior to the initiation of your research activities at those schools.  

The Human Subjects Committee (Institutional Review Board) of the University of Arizona has a current Federal Wide Assurance of compliance, number FWA00004218, which is on file with the Department of Health and Human Services and covers this activity.  

Approval is granted with the understanding that no further changes or additions will be made either to the procedures followed or to the consent form(s) used (copies of which we have on file) without the knowledge and approval of the Human Subjects Committee and your College or Departmental Review Committee. Any research related physical or psychological harm to any subject must also be reported to each committee.  

A university policy requires that all signed subject consent forms be kept in a permanent file in an area designated for that purpose by the Department Head or comparable authority. This will assure their accessibility in the event that university officials require the information and the principal investigator is unavailable for some reason.  

Sincerely yours,  

Theodore Clarke, Ph.D.  
Chair,  
Social and Behavioral Sciences Human Subjects Committee  

TIG:pm  

cc:      Departmental/College Review Committee
REFERENCES


Farrell, P. (1972). The meaning of the recreation experience in music as it is defined by urban adults who determined typal singer profiles through Q-technique. Dissertation Abstracts International, 33, 6949A-6950A. (UMI No. 73-13, 973)


dramatics program on student attitudes and achievement. In Welch, N. (Ed.),
Schools, Communities, and the Arts: A Research Compendium, (pp. 62-63).
Tempe, AZ: Arizona State University, Morrison Institute for Public Policy
(Original work published 1985).

In Hargreaves, D. J. & North, A. C. (Eds). The social psychology of music (pp.

student drawings to promote middle school improvement. Schools in the Middle,
7(3), 38-43.

Oxford University Press.

Hargreaves, D. J. & North, A. C. (1999). The functions of music in everyday life:
Redefining the social in music psychology. The Psychology of Music: 27, 71-83.

Carolina Press.


Hylton, J.B. (1980). The meaning of high school choral experience and its relationship to
selected variables. (Doctoral dissertation, The Pennsylvania State
University, 1980). University Microfilms International, 8024457.

Hylton, J. B. (1981). Dimensionality in high school student participants'
perceptions of the meaning of choral singing experience. Journal of

Columbus, OH: National Middle School Association.


